

# CUMULATIVE DIGEST

MATTERS REFERRED TO IN DECISIONS OF THE INDUSTRIAL APPEAL COURT, INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS COMMISSION AND INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATES COURT CONTAINED IN VOL. 100 PART 1, SUB PARTS 1 - 6.

## Digest Headings

\* Denotes New Heading

Industrial Appeal Court	Public Service Appeal Board
Full Bench	Public Service Arbitrator
Commission In Court Session	Commissioner
President	Board of Reference
Industrial Magistrate	Police Appeal

	Page
Editor's Note: The Registrar wishes to advise that as from January 2004, the format of the "Cumulative Digest" published at the back of the Western Australian Industrial Gazette has changed to incorporate "Catchword Phrases", please refer to the Notice at (83WAIG3937). All documents within the above headings are in chronological order.	

### INDUSTRIAL APPEAL COURT

Public service - Voluntary severance - Continuous service - Whether appellant's service in the Tasmanian public service to be taken into account with his service in the Western Australian public service in calculating his entitlement to a severance payment - Public Sector Management (Redeployment and Redundancy) Regulations 2014 (WA) - Award Wages Employees' Long Service Leave General Order of the Industrial Commission 1986 - Proper construction of relevant provisions - Appeal allowed - Floyd Bedford Browne and Director General Department of Water and Environmental Regulation - IAC 3 of 2018 - Industrial Appeal Court - Buss J/Murphy J/LeMiere J - 16/02/2020 .....	78
Industrial law - Appeals from the declaration and orders of the Full Bench of the Industrial Relations Commission - Applications for a stay pending the determination of the appeals - Applicable principles - Special or exceptional circumstances - Application for stay granted - Shop, Distributive and Allied Employees' Association of Western Australia, The and Samuel Gance (ABN 50 577 312 446) T/As Chemist Warehouse Perth, The Pharmacy Guild of Western Australia; The Minister for Commerce and Industrial Relations - IAC 3 of 2019 and IAC 4 of 2019 - Industrial Appeal Court - Buss J - 3/01/2020 .....	238

### FULL BENCH

Industrial Law (WA) – Appeal against a decision of the Commission – Award interpretation – The Shop and Warehouse (Wholesale and Retail Establishments) State Award 1977 – Award coverage of retail pharmacy industry – Whether Award terms are ambiguous – Glover scope clause – Going beyond scope clause and respondent's schedule to determine scope of an Award – Effect of other Award provisions on scope – effect of s 47 order of the Commission – FBA 2 of 2019 appeal upheld – FBA 3 of 2019 appeal upheld - The Pharmacy Guild of Western Australia -v- The Shop, Distributive and Allied Employees' Association of Western Australia - FBA 2 of 2019 and FBA 3 of 2019 - Full Bench - Chief Commissioner P E Scott/Senior Commissioner S J Kenner/Commissioner T B Walkington - 21/11/2019.....	1
Industrial Law (WA) – Supplementary reasons for decision in an appeal against a decision of the Commission – Award interpretation – The Shop and Warehouse (Wholesale and Retail Establishments) State Award 1977 – Award coverage of retail pharmacy industry – Whether Full Bench should vary the award to remedy any defect or give fuller effect to declaration – Glover scope clause and difficulty in identifying industry of respondents – Declaration of true interpretation of award and award varied - The Pharmacy Guild of Western Australia -v- The Shop, Distributive and Allied Employees' Association of Western Australia - FBA 2 of 2019 and FBA 3 of 2019 - Full Bench - Chief Commissioner P E Scott/Senior Commissioner S J Kenner/Commissioner T B Walkington - 9/12/2019.....	17
Industrial law (WA) – Appeal against a decision of the Commission – Commission's decision to dismiss claim of harsh, oppressive or unfair dismissal at first instance – Case management – Directions for witness statements to be filed – Witness summonsed – No statement of evidence filed for witness – Witness did not give evidence – Full Bench found witness ought to have been permitted to give evidence – Witness evidence may make different to findings of credibility and facts – Applicant alleged Commission erred in accepting witness evidence – Evidence in witness statement and under cross-examination compared – Appeal upheld – Operation of decision at first instance suspended – Matter remitted to Commission for further hearing and determination - Annie Derkacs -v- Tetyana Podkas trading as Phoenix Podiatry - FBA 12 of 2019 - Full Bench - Chief Commissioner P E Scott/Commissioner T Emmanuel/Commissioner D J Matthews - 24/02/2020.....	170
Industrial law (WA) – Appeal against decision of the Commission – Application barred by deed – Unlawful duress – Unconscionable conduct – Actual or threatened breaches of contract of employment – Discretionary decision – Alleged threat under Criminal Code to issue 'Show Cause' letter – Alleged failure to consider or properly consider implied contractual duty to act with good faith – Whether in the public interest to dismiss matter – Issues not raised at first instance cannot be raised on appeal – No relief on general grounds of unfairness – Alleged tort of deceit not raised at first instance – Appeal dismissed - Kay Heald -v- Metlabs (Australia) Pty Ltd - FBA 4 of 2019 - Full Bench - Chief Commissioner P E Scott/Senior Commissioner S J Kenner/Commissioner T B Walkington - 25/02/2020....	176
Industrial Law (WA) - Appeal against decision of the Industrial Magistrate in relation to overtime payments - Effect of Full Bench decision overturning declaration of Commission relied upon by Industrial Magistrate at first instance - Whether s 84 of the Act constitutes a strict appeal or an appeal by way of rehearing - Appeal under s 84 by way of rehearing and error must be established - decision at first instance given in legal and jurisdictional error - Award did not apply to the parties at material times and appellant had no standing to enforce Award - Decision varied - Sheryl Reardon -v- Gaetano Anthony Lagana (ABN 85 867 757 829) T/A Stratton Park Pharmacy - FBA 5 of 2019 - Full Bench - Senior Commissioner S J Kenner/Commissioner T Emmanuel/Commissioner T B Walkington - 20/12/2019 .....	243

## CUMULATIVE DIGEST—continued

	Page
<b>FULL BENCH—continued</b>	
Industrial Law (WA) – Appeal against decision of Industrial Magistrate to dismiss appellant’s claim at first instance – Seeking Contract Completion Payment under cl 20(5) of the Department of Health Medical Practitioners (Metropolitan Health Services) AMA Industrial Agreement 2013 – Delay in filing Notice of Appeal – Extension of time sought to file Notice of Appeal – Notice of Appeal did not identify grounds – Appeal book not filed – Extension of time granted – Appeal book to be filed within seven days – Dr Olumuyiwa Sorunmu -v- Director-General of Health First Respondent North Metropolitan Health Service Board - FBA 2 of 2020 - Full Bench - Senior Commissioner S J Kenner/Commissioner T Emmanuel/Commissioner D J Matthews - 17/03/2020 .....	347
Industrial Law (WA) – Appeal against decision of Industrial Magistrate to dismiss appellant’s claim at first instance – Seeking Contract Completion Payment under cl 20(5) of the Department of Health Medical Practitioners (Metropolitan Health Services) AMA Industrial Agreement 2013 – No error in reasoning of Industrial Magistrate – Appeal dismissed - Dr Olumuyiwa Sorunmu -v- Director-General of Health - FBA 2 of 2020 - Full Bench - Senior Commissioner S J Kenner/Commissioner T Emmanuel/Commissioner D J Matthews - 21/05/2020 .....	352
<b>COMMISSION IN COURT SESSION</b>	
Industrial law (WA) – General Order under s 50 – COVID-19 pandemic – Flexibility for leave arrangements – Enabling businesses to retain employees – Objects of the Industrial Relations Act 1979 – Unpaid pandemic leave, annual leave on half pay, annual leave in advance – Comparisons with Fair Work Commission modern awards - Commission’s Own Motion -v- (Not applicable) - APPL 16 of 2020 - Commission in Court Session - Chief Commissioner P E Scott/Senior Commissioner S J Kenner/Commissioner T Emmanuel/Commissioner D J Matthews/Commissioner T B Walkington - 14/04/2020 .....	231
<b>INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATE</b>	
INDUSTRIAL LAW – Application of Federal and State limitation periods to the claim – Accrual of cause of action – Alleged contraventions of Fair Work Act 2009 (Cth) and Professional Employees Award 2010 (Cth) – Jurisdiction of Industrial Magistrates Court under Industrial Relations Act 1979 (WA) – Application of Minimum Conditions of Employment Act 1993 (WA) – Adrian Manescu -v- Baker Hughes Australia Pty. Limited ABN: 20 004 752 050 - M 234 of 2018 - Industrial Magistrate - INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATE D. SCADDAN - 12/12/2019 .....	27
INDUSTRIAL LAW – Application of clause 33.1(e) of the Food, Beverage and Tobacco Manufacturing Award 2010 – Determinations on quantum - The Australian Workers’ Union -v- Vesco Foods Pty Ltd, trading as Vesco Foods - M 128 of 2018 - Industrial Magistrate - INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATE D. SCADDAN - 19/12/2019 .....	36
INDUSTRIAL LAW – Whether the claimant was an ‘employee’ of the respondent for the purposes of the Fair Work Act 2009 (Cth) or was an independent contractor – Whether the claimant was an ‘employee’ of the respondent for the purposes of the Long Service Leave Act 1958 (WA) or was an independent contractor – Interpretation of the definition of ‘employee’ in the Long Service Leave Act 1958 (WA) as ‘any person who is the owner of any vehicle used in the transport of goods if the person is in all other respects an employee’ - Craig Ivan Botica -v- Top Cut TMS Holdings Pty Ltd (ACN 134 606 661) - M 33 of 2018 - Industrial Magistrate - INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATE M. FLYNN - 30/01/2020 .....	102
Industrial Relations Act 1979 - Alleged breach of Instrument - Janine Marie Callan, Department of Mines, Industry Regulation and Safety -v- Samantha Naralee Goh-Edwards Trading As Samantha’s Hidden Valley - M 178 of 2018 - Industrial Magistrate - INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATE D. SCADDAN - 6/11/2019 .....	118
INDUSTRIAL LAW – Fair Work Act 2009 (Cth) – Claim for unpaid annual leave allegedly owed – Application by respondent for summary judgment or, in the alternative, strike out of the amended statement of claim – Construction of annual leave clauses in enterprise agreements – Consideration of even time rostering – Whether there is a real issue of fact or law to be tried - David Jones -v- Odyssey Marine Pty Ltd - M 94 of 2019 - Industrial Magistrate - INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATE D. SCADDAN - 26/02/2020 .....	188
INDUSTRIAL LAW – Determination of application to dismiss claim – Refusal of application to amend prior claim between the same parties – Res judicata - Abuse of process - Bernard Chipadza -v- Freo Group Pty Ltd - M 230 of 2019 - Industrial Magistrate - INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATE D. SCADDAN - 15/05/2020 .....	274
INDUSTRIAL LAW – Modern award coverage – Financial services – Application of Clerks – Private Sector Award 2010 (Cth) – Alleged contravention of terms of a modern award on award pay – Payment of untaken paid annual leave upon termination of employment – Contravention of National Employment Standards and Fair Work Act 2009 (Cth) – Payment of long service leave under Long Service Leave Act 1958 (WA) - Gavin Smith -v- Silkwood Holdings (WA) Pty Ltd as Trustee for the Diablo Discretionary Trust t/a Douglas Jones Financial Services - M 130 of 2018 - Industrial Magistrate - INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATE D. SCADDAN - 15/05/2020 .....	282
INDUSTRIAL LAW – Small Claim under the Fair Work Act 2009 (Cth) – Claim for unpaid wages alleged to be owed under an oral contract of employment – Whether the Claimant was employed by the Respondent – Whether the Claimant is an ‘employee’ for the purposes of the Fair Work Act 2009 (Cth) – Turns on its own facts - Henry C Aveling -v- Trade Houzz P/L as Trustee for Francis Family Trust trading as Solomons Flooring Cannington - M 122 of 2019 - Industrial Magistrate - INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATE D. SCADDAN - 15/05/2020 .....	296
Industrial Law (WA) – Long Service Leave Act 1958 (WA) – Whether casual employee entitled to long service leave – Meaning of ‘employee’ – Meaning of ‘continuous employment’ – Meaning of ‘absence authorised by employer’ – Meaning of ‘termination of employment’ – Meaning of ‘ordinary pay’ - Janine Callan, Department of Mines, Industry Regulation & Safety -v- Ubiquitous Holdings Pty Ltd (ACN: 072 254 301) - M 183 of 2018 - Industrial Magistrate - INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATE M. FLYNN - 6/05/2020 .....	302
INDUSTRIAL LAW – Small Claim under the Fair Work Act 2009 (Cth) – Contravention of modern award – Claim for unpaid wages alleged to be owed under Children’s Services Award 2010 (Cth) – Construction of a term of an award – Deduction of one week’s wages - Dini Yusdianingsih -v- Ashani Holdings Pty Ltd - M 86 of 2019 - Industrial Magistrate - INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATE D. SCADDAN - 4/06/2020 .....	356
INDUSTRIAL LAW – FAIR WORK – Assessment of pecuniary penalties for contraventions of Fair Work Act 2009 (Cth) - Gavin Smith -v- Silkwood Holdings (WA) Pty Ltd as Trustee for the Diablo Discretionary Trust t/a Douglas Jones Financial Services - M 130 of 2018 - Industrial Magistrate - INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATE D. SCADDAN - 11/06/2020 .....	362
<b>PUBLIC SERVICE APPEAL BOARD</b>	
Industrial law (WA) – Appeal against decision to terminate employment for substandard performance – No investigation held to determine whether or not the appellant’s performance was substandard – Failure to conduct an investigation under section 79(5) Public Sector Management Act 1994 open to be cured on appeal – In this case Public Service Appeal Board unable to determine question of substandard performance on evidence before it – Decision to dismiss quashed - Craig D’Rozario -v- Director General, Department of Transport - PSAB 24 of 2018 - Public Service Appeal Board - Commissioner D J Matthews - 17/01/2020 .....	154
Industrial Law - Appeal against the decision to terminate employment on 30 April 2019 - Whether the appellant’s performance was substandard - Whether the appellant was afforded procedural and substantive fairness - Whether the penalty of dismissal was disproportionate or harsh and unfair - Principles applied - Appellant had reasonable opportunity to demonstrate improvement in performance - Appellant’s error rate was high and performance was not attained or sustained at a reasonably expected level - Appeal Board should not interfere with respondent’s decision - Appeal dismissed - Julie Anderson -v- Managing Director, Department of Transport - PSAB 8 of 2019 - Public Service Appeal Board - Senior Commissioner S J Kenner - 26/02/2020 .....	212

CUMULATIVE DIGEST—*continued*

	Page
<b>PUBLIC SERVICE APPEAL BOARD—<i>continued</i></b>	
Public Service Appeal Board – Jurisdiction of the Public Service Appeal Board – Commissioner’s Instruction 23 – Fixed term contract – Appellant was not dismissed - Rachel Catherine Townes-Vigh -v- North Metropolitan Health Service - PSAB 10 of 2019 - Public Service Appeal Board - Commissioner T Emmanuel - 31/03/2020 .....	256
<b>PUBLIC SERVICE ARBITRATOR</b>	
Industrial Relations Law (WA) - Application for interim relief under s 44 of the Industrial Relations Act 1979 - Application considered - Requisite opinion as to how continuation of employment would encourage the parties to exchange or divulge attitudes or information not formed - Actions of respondent do not evidence an attitude uncondusive to the exchange of information and attitudes - Application dismissed - Civil Service Association (Inc.) -v- Department of Water and Environmental Regulation - PSAC 19 of 2019 - Public Service Arbitrator - Senior Commissioner S J Kenner - 7/11/2019 .....	138
Public Service Commissioner’s Instruction 23 - Conversion of fixed term contract and casual employees in WA public sector to permanent status - Employee employed on series of fixed term contracts over several years - Principles of interpretation applied - Employee did not meet requirements to be eligible for conversion to permanency - Application dismissed - Civil Service Association (Inc.) -v- Department of Water and Environmental Regulation - PSAC 19 of 2019 - Public Service Arbitrator - Senior Commissioner S J Kenner - 17/04/2020.....	325
<b>COMMISSIONER</b>	
Harsh, oppressive and unfair dismissal, whether dismissal or resignation, no dismissal at initiative of employer - Industrial Relations Act 1979 (WA) s 29(1)(b)(i) - Elisabetta Marrapodi -v- Mr Zane Charles Norman Trewin Norman & Co. - U 22 of 2019 - Commissioner T B Walkington - 18/12/2019 .....	55
Contractual benefits claim - salary review - commission payments - express terms - implied terms - collateral contract - Jo Anne Stones -v- Director Troy Barbagallo The Horologist Pty Ltd - B 139 of 2018 - Commissioner T B Walkington - 20/12/2019.....	58
Industrial law (WA) – Denied contractual benefit claim – Claimed entitlement to salary – Claim for denied contractual benefit upheld – Order issued – Name of respondent amended - Fiona van Heerwaarden -v- Richard James Trainer, the Trustee for the M4 Unit Trust - B 142 of 2019 - Commissioner D J Matthews - 17/01/2020.....	132
Industrial law (WA) - Unfair dismissal application - Respondent raises jurisdictional objection on basis that applicant resigned - Applicant claims constructive dismissal - Taking applicant's case at its highest there was no dismissal - No jurisdiction for application to be determined by Western Australian Industrial Relations Commission as there was no dismissal - Nicola Nathan -v- The State of Western Australia Department of Education - U 150 of 2019 - Commissioner D J Matthews - 30/01/2020.....	134
Industrial law (WA) - Unfair dismissal application - Respondent raises jurisdictional objection on basis that applicant resigned - Applicant claims constructive dismissal - Application filed out of time - Unable to decide questions - Jurisdiction and matter to accept out of time to be determined at substantive hearing - Sarah Colomb -v- Department of Education Western Australia - U 145 of 2019 - Commissioner D J Matthews - 30/01/2020.....	137
Industrial Law (WA) - termination of employment - Harsh, oppressive or unfair dismissal claim - name of respondent - Whether Commission has jurisdiction - Trusts and trustees - Trading activities of respondent - Aiden Bilcich -v- GLS ENTERPRISES PTY LTD AS TRUSTEE FOR THE GLEN SIMS FAMILY TRUST AND BATHURST PTY LTD AS TRUSTEE FOR THE ROSE FAMILY TRUST - U 152 of 2019 - Commissioner T B Walkington - 6/03/2020 .....	199
Denied benefit under contract of employment – Dismissed on grounds that no real question to be tried – Breach of contract – Unfair dismissal - Kieran Knight -v- Final Trim Operators Pty Ltd - B 24 of 2019 - Commissioner T B Walkington - 28/01/2020 .....	203
Industrial Law (WA) - Termination of employment - Harsh, oppressive or unfair dismissal claim - Whether Commission has jurisdiction - Trading activities of respondent - Troy Hermes-Smith -v- Ruc CEMENTATION MINING CONTRACTORS PTY LTD - U 136 of 2019 - Commissioner T B Walkington - 27/02/2020.....	206
Improvement Notice - reg 3.23(2) of the Occupational Safety and Health Regulations 1996 (WA) - Powers of the Occupational Safety and Health Tribunal (WA) - Employer obligations - Halifax Crane Hire Pty Ltd -v- WorkSafe - OSHT 8 of 2019 - Commissioner T B Walkington - 6/03/2020.....	220
Benefit Under a Contract - Prescribed Amount - Interpretation of Legislation and Regulations - Nigel John Barr -v- The Slatter Group WA Pty Ltd - B 114 of 2019 - Commissioner T B Walkington - 15/05/2020 .....	318
Industrial Law (WA) - Unfair dismissal application - Summons to produce documents objected to - Documents subject to legal professional privilege - Order for production of some documents that are not subject to legal professional privilege made - Sarah Colomb -v- Department of Education Western Australia - U 145 of 2019 - Commissioner D J Matthews - 17/04/2020.....	322
Termination of employment - Claim of harsh, oppressive or unfair dismissal - Fernando De Andrade -v- Peppermint Grove Jewellers - U 131 of 2019 - Commissioner T B Walkington - 26/05/2020.....	368
Industrial law (WA) – Unfair dismissal claim made on behalf of applicant’s member – Dismissal on medical grounds found to be unfair by decision published 28 August 2018 – Return to work found to be impracticable by decision published 28 August 2018 – Money award ordered 30 August 2018 – Appeal to Full Bench of Western Australian Industrial Relations Commission against decision that a return to work impracticable successful – Remedy at first instance quashed - Remitted by Full Bench of the Western Australian Industrial Relations Commission for further hearing and determination as to remedy – Cannot revisit whether dismissal unfair as remittal only in relation to remedy – Parties agree return to work to be addressed in relation to schools other than Busselton Senior High School - Applicant’s member medically fit for employment at school other than Busselton Senior High School – Order made in relation to financial loss resulting from dismissal made - Money award reduced due to applicant’s member’s failure to make efforts to mitigate loss - Money award reduced due to applicant failing to disclose document at first instance hearing – Application for matter to be dismissed pursuant to s 27 Industrial Relations Act 1979 dismissed - The State School Teachers’ Union of W.A. (Incorporated) -v- Director-General, Department of Education - CR 15 of 2018 - Commissioner D J Matthews - 26/05/2020.....	371
Review of Improvement Notices - application to review decision of the Worksafe Western Australia Commissioner to not grant an exemption from compliance with reg 3.54(1)(b) of the Occupational Safety and Health Regulations 1996 (WA) - substantial compliance - whether compliance is unnecessary - hierarchy of hazard controls - Hanssen Pty Ltd -v- Worksafe Western Australia Commissioner - OSHT 2 of 2018 and OSHT 3 of 2018 and OSHT 4 of 2018 and OSHT 3 of 2019 - Commissioner T B Walkington - 28/02/2020 .....	384
Review of Improvement Notices - Application to review decision of the Worksafe Western Australia Commissioner to not grant an exemption from compliance with reg 3.54(1)(b) of the Occupational Safety and Health Regulations 1996 (WA) - Substantial compliance - Whether compliance is unnecessary - Hierarchy of hazard controls - Hanssen Pty Ltd -v- Worksafe Western Australia Commissioner - OSHT 2 of 2018 and OSHT 3 of 2018 and OSHT 4 of 2018 and OSHT 3 of 2019 - Commissioner T B Walkington - 25/05/2020 .....	396