

# CUMULATIVE DIGEST

MATTERS REFERRED TO IN DECISIONS OF THE INDUSTRIAL APPEAL COURT, INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS COMMISSION AND INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATES COURT CONTAINED IN VOL. 102 PART 2, SUB PARTS 1 - 9.

## Digest Headings

\* Denotes New Heading

Industrial Appeal Court	Public Service Appeal Board
Full Bench	Public Service Arbitrator
Commission In Court Session	Commissioner
Board of Reference	Industrial Magistrate
Police Appeal	

	Page
Editor's Note: The Registrar wishes to advise that as from January 2004, the format of the "Cumulative Digest" published at the back of the Western Australian Industrial Gazette has changed to incorporate "Catchword Phrases", please refer to the Notice at (83WAIG3937). All documents within the above headings are in chronological order.	

### INDUSTRIAL APPEAL COURT

Industrial law - Appeal against decision of the Full Bench of the Commission dismissing an appeal for want of jurisdiction against a decision of Industrial Magistrate's Court on grounds the Industrial Magistrate exercised Federal jurisdiction when dismissing a claim for entitlements under a Federal award and the Fair Work Act 2009 (Cth) - Industrial law - Decision of the Full Bench dismissing the appeal for want of jurisdiction not erroneous in law - In dismissing the claim on grounds of abuse of process the Industrial Magistrate applied the practice and procedure prescribed by State law - Full Bench has no power to review a decision of the Industrial Magistrate's Court when exercising Federal jurisdiction - State procedural laws applied to the resolution of a matter within federal jurisdiction do not operate of their own force but as Commonwealth law - Practice and procedure - Procedural fairness - Right to be heard - No breach by the Full Bench of the hearing rule - Practice and procedure - No error demonstrated by the Full Bench in the construction and interpretation of its power to make an award of costs - Practice and procedure - Appeal to the court frivolous and vexatious - Award of costs made - Appeal dismissed - Appellant to pay the respondent's costs of the appeal fixed at \$3,000 - Adrian Manescu -v- Baker Hughes Australia Pty. Limited ABN:20 004 762 050 - IAC 2 of 2021 - Industrial Appeal Court - Buss J/Murphy J/Smith J - 27/07/2022 .....	1124
---	------

### FULL BENCH

Industrial Law (WA) - Appeal against decision of Industrial Magistrate - Jurisdiction of the court - Claim not within court's jurisdiction - Appeal dismissed - Michael Coe -v- Department of Education - FBA 7 of 2021 - Full Bench - Chief Commissioner S J Kenner/Senior Commissioner R Cosentino/Commissioner T B Walkington - 17/02/2022 .....	1184
Industrial law (WA) - Appeal against decision of the Commission - Procedural fairness - Right of applicant to examine a witness not called - Contract interpretation - Relevant principles applied - Length of contract of employment - Whether the Commission erred in finding contract was for three discrete periods - Appeal dismissed - Adrian Doyle -v- Roman Catholic Bishop of Bunbury - FBA 8 of 2021 - Full Bench - Chief Commissioner S J Kenner/Senior Commissioner R Cosentino/Commissioner T Emmanuel - 29/07/2022 .....	1125
Industrial law (WA) - Appeal against the decision of the Industrial Magistrate - Whether the respondent was made redundant in accordance with the General Order of the Commission made under s 50 of the Industrial Relations Act 1979 - Relevant principles of interpretation of industrial instruments considered and applied - Whether open for appellants to raise point not argued at first instance on appeal - Relevant principles considered and applied - Alleged errors of fact and law - No error demonstrated - Appeal dismissed - B. K Elsegood & D.S Elsegood & D.K Elsegood & Elsegood Holdings Pty Ltd & S.M Elsegood & Falconcrest Holdings Pty Ltd -v- Alan Mahon - FBA 1 of 2022 - Full Bench - Chief Commissioner S J Kenner/Senior Commissioner R Cosentino/Commissioner T B Walkington - 22/08/2022.....	1171
Industrial law (WA) - Appeal against decision of Industrial Magistrate to enter default judgment - Proper parties to appeal - Legal personality of unincorporated partnership - Whether proceedings can be brought in name of partnership - Jurisdiction of Full Bench limited to decision that is subject of appeal - No power of Full Bench to substitute decision under appeal for another decision - Appeal of interlocutory order not competent - Appeal dismissed - Y.D HUI -v- Brian Edward Ravenscroft - FBA 9 of 2021 - Full Bench - Chief Commissioner S J Kenner/Commissioner T Emmanuel/Commissioner T B Walkington - 19/10/2022 .....	1351
Industrial Law (WA) - Appeal against the decision of the Commission - Appealable error - Assessment of merits of grounds - Discretionary factors to extend time to appeal - Discretion to do justice between parties - Extension of time to appeal - No prospects of success of appeal - Summons to witnesses - Time limit for appealing a decision - 12 months out of time - Adrian Doyle -v- The Roman Catholic Bishop of Bunbury - FBA 2 of 2022 - Full Bench - Chief Commissioner S J Kenner/Senior Commissioner R Cosentino/Commissioner T Emmanuel - 24/11/2022 .....	1533
Industrial Law - Appeal against the decision of the Commission - Dismissal of employee - Whether the Commissioner erred in finding there had been a dismissal - Whether the Commissioner erred in finding the dismissal unfair - No error established - Appeal dismissed - XU HONG BIN -v- Yan Li - FBA 10 of 2021 - Full Bench - Chief Commissioner S J Kenner/Commissioner T Emmanuel/Commissioner T B Walkington - 29/11/2022.....	1537

### COMMISSION IN COURT SESSION

State Wage order - Commission's own motion - Minimum wage for employees under the Minimum Conditions of Employment Act 1993 - Award rates of wage - Award minimum wage - State Wage principles - Commission's Own Motion -v- (Not applicable) - CICS 1 of 2022 - Commission in Court Session - Chief Commissioner S J Kenner/Senior Commissioner R Cosentino/Commissioner T Emmanuel/Commissioner T B Walkington - 23/06/2022 .....	431
Industrial Law (WA) - Application by the Registrar to cancel the registration of an organisation - Organisation has few remaining members - Organisation defunct and requested cancellation of registration - Application granted - The Registrar, Western Australian Industrial Relations Commission -v- The Electrical and Communications Association of Western Australia (Union of Employers) - CICS 4 of 2022 - Commission in Court Session - Chief Commissioner S J Kenner/Senior Commissioner R Cosentino/Commissioner T Emmanuel - 27/06/2022 .....	457

## CUMULATIVE DIGEST—continued

	Page
<b>INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATE</b>	
Industrial Law – Awarding of Costs – Frivolous or Vexatious - Relevant principles applied – Costs Awarded - Bralea Pty Ltd as the Trustee for the Bralea Trust (commonly known as Lone Ranges Shooting Complex) -v- The Australian Workers Union - M 168 of 2020 - Industrial Magistrate - Industrial Magistrate B. Coleman - 31/08/2022.....	1195
Industrial Law – Interpretation of industrial agreement – consideration of industrial context in which agreement formulated – nature of employment (casual) as against job classification – whether nature of role incorporated into classification - Robert Cacciola -v- Serco Australia Pty Ltd - M 120 of 2021 - Industrial Magistrate - Industrial Magistrate E. O'Donnell - 9/09/2022.....	1203
Industrial Law – Café workplace – job classification – provision of meal breaks - Briohny Barrett -v- Callegari Projects Pty Ltd - M 30 of 2021 - Industrial Magistrate - Industrial Magistrate E. O'Donnell - 9/09/2022.....	1198
Industrial Law – Breach of award – Underpayments and denial of benefits – Flat hourly rate in excess of award entitlement for ordinary time – Method of calculation of amount due to employee - Brian Robert Clifford-Smith -v- Keen Bros. (WA) Pty Ltd - M 29 of 2020 - Industrial Magistrate - Industrial Magistrate E. O'Donnell - 12/10/2022.....	1291
Industrial Law – Breach of award – inadvertent error on part of employer – acceptance of breach – nominal penalty – public interest - Construction, Forestry, Maritime, Mining & Energy Union -v- OSM Australia Pty Ltd - M 218 of 2021 - Industrial Magistrate - Industrial Magistrate E. O'Donnell - 12/10/2022.....	1298
Industrial Law – Interpretation of industrial agreement – consideration of whether extraneous materials should inform the interpretation of definitions within the agreement – whether the respondents accurately assessed qualifications and experience at the commencement of employment – whether the respondents correctly transitioned between levels of employment - MR Rufus Sadat Anwar Gill -v- Goldfields Baptist College Incorporated, Mr Craig Dredge - M 59 of 2021 - Industrial Magistrate - Industrial Magistrate B. Coleman - 3/11/2022.....	1378
<b>PUBLIC SERVICE APPEAL BOARD</b>	
Industrial Law (WA) – Public Service Appeal Board – Appeal lodged out of time – Whether to grant an extension of time within which to appeal – Out of time application refused - Naomi Mackay -v- North Metropolitan Health Services (WA Health) - PSAB 33 of 2022 - Public Service Appeal Board - Senior Commissioner R Cosentino - 7/07/2022.....	500
Public Service Appeal Board – Application to dismiss appeal under s 27(1)(a) – Appellant cannot perform his role because of an undertaking given to the Australian Health Practitioner Regulation Agency – Not in the public interest to hear appeal – Section 27(1)(a) application to dismiss appeal upheld - Brock Delfante -v- North Metropolitan Health Service - PSAB 15 of 2022 - Public Service Appeal Board - Commissioner T Emmanuel - 13/07/2022.....	493
Industrial Law (WA) - Public Service Appeal Board - Appeal under s 172 of the Health Services Act 2016 and s 80I(1)(c) of the Industrial Relations Act 1979 - Review of decision de novo - Misconduct findings - Disciplinary action - Penalty imposed in the form of a reprimand and a transfer - Email sent to senior managers expressing concerns with restructure - Appellant found not to have acted inappropriately so as to amount to misconduct - Finding of no misconduct that the decision should be adjusted - Whether reinstatement impracticable - Appeal upheld - Michelle Noble -v- North Metropolitan Health Service - PSAB 17 of 2022 - Public Service Appeal Board - Senior Commissioner R Cosentino - 13/09/2022.....	1251
Public Service Appeal Board – Dismissal – Mandatory vaccination – Appellant unable to enter workplace because of vaccination status – Duties cannot be done entirely remotely – Appellant disobeyed a reasonable lawful order – Dismissal not unfair - Jessica Heller-Bhatt -v- Director General, Department of Communities - PSAB 6 of 2022 - Public Service Appeal Board - Commissioner T Emmanuel - 14/10/2022.....	1457
Public Service Appeal Board – Breaches of discipline – Negligence and carelessness in the performance of his functions – Misconduct – Dismissal – Meaning of 'negligence', 'careless' and 'function' – Dismissal a proportionate penalty – Appeal dismissed - Michael John Millward -v- North Metropolitan Health Service - PSAB 1 of 2021 - Public Service Appeal Board - Commissioner T Emmanuel - 8/11/2022.....	1470
<b>PUBLIC SERVICE ARBITRATOR</b>	
Industrial Law (WA) – Public Service Arbitrator – Section 44 application – Dispute regarding Private Practice Cost Allowance – Application for dismissal – Jurisdiction of the Arbitrator – Enforcement of an industrial instrument – Interpretation of an industrial instrument – Contravention of 'no further claims' clause of the relevant industrial instrument – Judicial or arbitral powers – Section 44 does not give the Arbitrator judicial power or jurisdiction to enforce industrial instruments nor to merely construe them – Application dismissed for want of jurisdiction - Australian Medical Association (WA) Incorporated -v- Child and Adolescent Health Service (CAHS) - PSAC 9 of 2022 - Public Service Arbitrator - Senior Commissioner R Cosentino - 18/10/2022.....	1438
<b>COMMISSIONER</b>	
Industrial law (WA) - Application under s 66 - Waiver of Rules to enable Executive Committee meetings - Proposed changes to Rules - Rule to be waived - The Construction, Forestry, Mining and Energy Union of Workers, The Plumbers and Gasfitters Employees' Union of Australia, West Australian Branch, Industrial Union of Workers -v- Building Trades Association of Unions of Western Australia (Association of Workers) - PRES 4 of 2022 - Chief Commissioner S J Kenner - 1/06/2022.....	471
Denied contractual benefits – No appearance by the respondent – Whether applicant was an employee or independent contractor – Applicant was an employee – Claim for unpaid wages, food allowance and air ticket upheld - Inder Bhatia -v- Dack WA Pty Ltd - B 59 of 2021 - Commissioner T Emmanuel - 10/06/2022.....	460
Industrial Law (WA) – Public Service Appeal Board – Application for examination of witness before hearing of appeal – Interests of justice – Sanja Spasojevic -v- Speaker of the Legislative Assembly - PSAB 31 of 2020 - Senior Commissioner R Cosentino - 20/06/2022.....	483
Work Health and Safety Tribunal – Applications for discovery – Orders issued - Julian Cosentino -v- Director General, Department of Education - OSHT 3 of 2022 - Commissioner T Emmanuel - 6/07/2022.....	475
Industrial Law (WA) – Contractual Benefit Claim – Continued participation in government vehicle scheme – Application made for summary dismissal – Jurisdiction to hear and determine application – Whether the Commission has jurisdiction – Whether or not the applicant was a government officer – Applicant found to be a member of the respondent's salaried staff – Application dismissed - Theresa Maureen Williams -v- Government of Western Australia Mental Health Commission - B 71 of 2022 - Senior Commissioner R Cosentino - 14/07/2022.....	467
Industrial Law (WA) – Unfair dismissal application – Apparent applicant did not intend to prosecute claim following conciliation outcome – s 27(1)(a) – Summary dismissal – Public interest - Lindy Yusufu -v- East Metropolitan Health Service - U 36 of 2022 - Senior Commissioner R Cosentino - 26/07/2022.....	1143
Industrial Law (WA) – Application under s 66 - Alleged failure to comply with Union Rules - Delay in request by Secretary to Registrar for an election to be held - Electoral Commission unable to meet requirement to conduct election in prescribed period - Extension of time sought - Application to intervene in proceedings by union member and Registrar - Consideration of principles for intervention - Applications for leave to intervene refused - Waiver of Rules and extension of time granted - Order issued - Michael Barrie Clancy -v- The Australian Nursing Federation Industrial Union of Workers Perth - PRES 6 of 2022 - Chief Commissioner S J Kenner - 3/08/2022.....	1235
Section 46 interpretation – Application for leave to intervene – Proposed intervener does not have sufficient interest to be granted leave to intervene – Application for leave to intervene dismissed - Western Australian Prison Officers' Union of Workers -v- Minister for Corrective Services - APPL 15 of 2022 - Commissioner T Emmanuel - 29/08/2022.....	1188
Work Health and Safety Tribunal – Objection to discovering documents – Document categories requested too broad and relate to matters not yet before the Tribunal – Objection to discovery upheld - Consolidated Pastoral Company Pty Ltd -v- WorkSafe Western Australia Commissioner - OSHT 4 of 2021 - Commissioner T Emmanuel - 29/08/2022.....	1265
Work Health and Safety Tribunal – Objection to discovering documents – Document categories requested too broad and relate to matters not yet before the Tribunal – Objection to discovery upheld - Hancock Prospecting Pty Ltd -v- WorkSafe Western Australia Commissioner - OSHT 5 of 2021 - Commissioner T Emmanuel - 29/08/2022.....	1270

CUMULATIVE DIGEST—*continued*

	Page
COMMISSIONER— <i>continued</i>	
Industrial Law (WA) - Termination of employment - Harsh, oppressive and unfair dismissal - Entitlements under contract of employment - Whether Commission has jurisdiction - Principles applied - Claim beyond Commission's jurisdiction - Application dismissed - Karl Williams -v- WA Main Roads - U 89 of 2022 and B 89 of 2022 - Commissioner T Kucera - 13/09/2022 .....	1232
Industrial Law (WA) - Order pursuant to s 66 - Powers of the Chief Commissioner under s 66(2) - Election for office holders - Compliance with registered Rules - Election provisions of the Act - Failure of union to comply with rule - Declaration issued - Orders issued - The Registrar, Western Australian Industrial Relations Commission -v- The Australian Nursing Federation, Industrial Union of Workers Perth - PRES 7 of 2022 - Chief Commissioner S J Kenner - 21/09/2022 .....	1315
Termination of Employment; genuine redundancy; unfair dismissal; employer identity - Lucy Ann Scaife -v- P Mundada Family Trust (Shreeji WA Pty Ltd) - U 77 of 2021 - Commissioner T B Walkington - 27/09/2022 .....	1303
Industrial Law (WA) - Unfair dismissal application - Whether the Commission has jurisdiction - Dismissal as a requirement for jurisdiction - Casual employment - No firm advance commitment - Whether cancellation of future shifts is termination at initiative of employer - Employment not of indefinite duration with definite or regular hours fixed in advance - Working under separate and distinct contacts of employment - Satish Balagopalan -v- South Metropolitan Health Service - U 64 of 2022 - Senior Commissioner R Cosentino - 28/09/2022 .....	1306
Industrial law (WA) - Order pursuant to s 66 - Election for office holders - Waiver of rules - Changes to branch structure of federal organisation - Orders issued - Joshua Dekuyer -v- The Australian Rail, Tram and Bus Industry Union of Employees, West Australian Branch - PRES 9 of 2022 - Chief Commissioner S J Kenner - 4/10/2022 .....	1313
Termination of employment; unfair dismissal; failure to prosecute claim; no appearance by applicant - Emily Elizabeth Mae Gibson -v- Shire of Halls Creek - U 63 of 2021 - Commissioner T B Walkington - 14/10/2022 .....	1401
Industrial Law (WA) - Unfair dismissal - Termination of employment - Apprentice - Was there a dismissal? - Did the applicant's conduct justify dismissal? - Dismissal found to be harsh, oppressive and unfair - Compensation for loss of wages - Ma Shanley Zoe Fermo -v- Tamana Sharif as Trustee for Kheirkhah Family Trust - U 85 of 2022 - Senior Commissioner R Cosentino - 17/10/2022 .....	1412
Industrial Law (WA) - Application to strike out unfair dismissal claim - improper conduct - personal insults and threats of legal proceedings - capacity or tendency to interfere with the administration of justice - he or she who seeks equity must do equity, and he or she must also come with clean hands - Respondent's interlocutory application upheld - Unfair dismissal application dismissed - Verona Marie Wauchope -v- Director-General, Department of Education - U 53 of 2021 - Commissioner C Tsang - 20/10/2022 .....	1415
Industrial Law (WA) - Application for unfair dismissal to be dismissed - Want of jurisdiction - Jurisdiction of commission - Public Service Appeal Board - Government officer - Laboratory Technician - Administrative or clerical duties - On the salaried staff - Respondent's interlocutory application upheld - Unfair dismissal application dismissed for want of jurisdiction - Loanne Carter -v- Department of Education WA - U 65 of 2022 - Commissioner C Tsang - 20/10/2022 .....	1405
Class 2 Demolition Licence, lawfully obtained experience - safe and proper manner - demolition work - reviewable experience - proportionality - equity, good conscience, and the substantial merits of the case - Sean Patrick Lamprecht -v- Worksafe Western Australia Commissioner Department of Mines, Industry Regulation and Safety - OSHT 3 of 2021 - Commissioner T B Walkington - 28/10/2022 .....	1510
Industrial Law (WA) - Application to vary award - Increasing allowances - Deletion of respondents no longer trading or no longer in existence - Updating respondent's details - Electrical Trades Union WA -v- Electrical Group Training and others - APPL 37 of 2022 - Senior Commissioner R Cosentino - 17/11/2022 .....	1556
Industrial Law (WA) - Application under section 66 - Interlocutory orders and directions - Principles applicable to discovery and inspection - Membership records of first respondent - Whether discovery and inspection would be just - Orders issued - Samantha Fenn -v- The Australian Nursing Federation, Industrial Union of Workers Perth - PRES 10 of 2022 - Chief Commissioner S J Kenner - 23/11/2022...	1577