

CUMULATIVE DIGEST

MATTERS REFERRED TO IN DECISIONS OF THE INDUSTRIAL APPEAL COURT, INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS COMMISSION AND INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATES COURT CONTAINED IN VOL. 103 PART 1, SUB PARTS 1 - 6.

Digest Headings

* Denotes New Heading

Industrial Appeal Court	Public Service Appeal Board
Full Bench	Public Service Arbitrator
Commission In Court Session	Commissioner
Board of Reference	Industrial Magistrate
Police Appeal	

	Page
Editor's Note: The Registrar wishes to advise that as from January 2004, the format of the "Cumulative Digest" published at the back of the Western Australian Industrial Gazette has changed to incorporate "Catchword Phrases", please refer to the Notice at (83 WAIG 3937). All documents within the above headings are in chronological order.	
<hr/>	
INDUSTRIAL APPEAL COURT	
Industrial Law - Appeal from the Full Bench of the Western Australian Industrial Relations Commission dismissing interlocutory applications in an appeal - Industrial Relations Act 1979 (WA) s 90(1) - Appeal to Industrial Appeal Court moot - Industrial Law - Jurisdiction of Industrial Appeal Court to hear appeal not enlivened - Appeal dismissed - Adrian Doyle -v- Roman Catholic Bishop of Bunbury - IAC 1 of 2022 - Industrial Appeal Court - Buss J/Murphy J/Smith J - 31/01/2023	74
Industrial Appeal Court - Whether Court has jurisdiction to hear appeal from a decision of the Western Australian Industrial Relations Commission dismissing an appeal heard pursuant to div 3 of pt X of the Prisons Act 1981 (WA) - Court only has jurisdiction to hear an appeal if the Commission has made a decision of the Commission under s 110E of the Prisons Act - A decision to dismiss not a decision under s 110E of the Prisons Act - Industrial Law - A decision of the Commission under the Prisons Act within the meaning of s 90 of the Industrial Relations Act 1979 (WA) is not the reasons given for decision - Reasons given by a minority member of the Commission do not constitute a decision for the purposes of an appeal to the Court under s 90 of the Industrial Relations Act - Appeal dismissed for want of jurisdiction, Alexander Byers -V- Director-General, Department of Justice, IAC 2 of 2022, Industrial Appeal Court Buss J/Murphy J/Smith J - 23/02/2023	267
FULL BENCH	
Industrial Law - Appeal against the decision of the Commission - Denied contractual benefits - Relevant principles applied - Contractual interpretation - Jurisdiction of the Commission to determine claims in based on principles of unjust enrichment - Jurisdiction of Commission to award remedy on quantum meruit - Whether contract terms should be held to be unenforceable on the grounds of uncertainty or being illusory - Terms not uncertain or illusory - Appeal dismissed - Levi Rohan -v- S&DH Enterprises Pty Ltd - FBA 6 of 2022 - Full Bench - Chief Commissioner S J Kenner/Commissioner T Emmanuel/Commissioner T B Walkington - 14/02/2023	174
Industrial law (WA) - Interlocutory orders and directions - Application for discovery of documents - Whether discovery and inspection would be just and reasonable - Application of penalty privilege - Relevant principles applied - Orders issued - The Registrar, Western Australian Industrial Relations Commission -v- Janet Reah and Another - FBM 1 of 2022 and FBM 2 of 2022 - Full Bench - Chief Commissioner S J Kenner/Commissioner T Emmanuel/Commissioner T Kucera - 15/02/2023	198
Industrial law (WA) - Interlocutory application - Inadequate discovery - Application for interrogatories - Application granted in part - Orders issued - The Registrar, Western Australian Industrial Relations Commission -v- Australian Nursing Federation, Industrial Union of Workers Perth - FBM 2 of 2022 - Full Bench - Chief Commissioner S J Kenner/Commissioner T Emmanuel/Commissioner T Kucera - 21/03/2023	271
Industrial Law (WA) - Applications pursuant to section 84A - Enforcement of orders of the Commission - Whether industrial action taken was in breach of Commission orders - Obligations of union and union officials under the Act - Characterisation of contraventions - Agreed penalty - Relevant principles applied - Declarations and orders issued - The Registrar, Western Australian Industrial Relations Commission -v- Janet Reah; Australian Nursing Federation, Industrial Union of Workers Perth - FBM 1 of 2022 and FBM 2 of 2022 - Full Bench - Chief Commissioner S J Kenner/Commissioner T Emmanuel/Commissioner T Kucera - 26/05/2023	531
COMMISSION IN COURT SESSION	
Industrial Law (WA) - Application pursuant to s 62(2) - Alteration of registered rules - Jurisdiction of Commission in Court Session to exercise powers of the Registrar - Statutory powers of the Registrar and Commission in Court Session - Orders issued - Application granted in part - The Australian Rail, Tram And Bus Industry Union of Employees, West Australian Branch -V- (Not Applicable) - CICS 24 of 2022 - Commission in Court Session - Chief Commissioner S J Kenner/Senior Commissioner R Cosentino/Commissioner T Kucera - 17/02/2023	208
Industrial Law (WA) - Application pursuant to s 71 - Declaration sought - Qualifications of persons for memberships of a State branch of a federal organisation and offices that exist within the State organisation - Declaration issued - The Australian Rail, Tram and Bus Industry Union of Employees, Western Australia Branch -v- (Not Applicable) - CICS 25 of 2022 - Commission in Court Session - Chief Commissioner S J Kenner/Senior Commissioner R Cosentino/Commissioner T Kucera - 21/04/2023	414
Industrial law (WA) - Application for General Order - Provisions in industrial instruments for days declared special public holidays - Payment for working on special public holidays - General Order issued - UnionsWA Incorporated -v- Minister for Industrial Relations, Chamber of Commerce and Industry of Western Australia (Inc), Australian Resources and Energy Employer Association - CICS 3 of 2023 - Commission in Court Session - Chief Commissioner S J Kenner/Senior Commissioner R Cosentino/Commissioner T B Walkington - 12/05/2023	527
INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATE	
Industrial Law - Breach of award - recognition of representational capacity of union - recognition of choice of representative - where employees subject to disciplinary action - construction of the term "recognise" in subclauses of Award cl. 36A - The Civil Service Association of Western Australia Incorporated (the CSA) -v- Director General, Department of Justice as the employing authority - M 170 of 2021 - Industrial Magistrate - Industrial Magistrate E. O'Donnell - 22/03/2023	319

CUMULATIVE DIGEST—continued

	Page
INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATE—continued	
Long Service Leave; Statutory construction; Unilateral nomination of accrued Long Service Leave; Employer refusal of employee request - Stephen Smith -v- Pilbara Iron Company (Services) Pty Ltd - M 33 of 2021 - Industrial Magistrate - Industrial Magistrate B. Coleman - 19/04/2023.....	427
PUBLIC SERVICE APPEAL BOARD	
Industrial Law (WA) – Public Service Appeal Board – Board’s jurisdiction – Casual security officer – Compensation sought for cancelled shifts – Remedies under s 80I – Adjusting decision – Practicability of reinstatement – Unvaccinated against COVID-19 – Appeal dismissed - David James Stevens -v- North Metropolitan Health Service - PSAB 41 of 2022 - Public Service Appeal Board - Senior Commissioner R Cosentino - 20/12/2022.....	47
Industrial Law (WA) – Public Service Appeal Board – Dismissal decision – Electorate Officer – Nature of leave entitlements – Abuse of personal leave entitlements – abuse of annual leave entitlements – Whether misconduct established – Whether dismissal oppressive, harsh or unfair – Whether disparate treatment – Whether conduct condoned – Mitigating factors - Sanja Spasojevic -v- Speaker of the Legislative Assembly - PSAB 31 of 2020 - Public Service Appeal Board - Senior Commissioner R Cosentino - 5/01/2023.....	138
PSAB – Public Service Appeal Board – Misconduct – Negligent and Careless Conduct – Discipline – Workload – Dismissal - Karen Rotherham -v- Department of Biodiversity, Conservation and Attractions - PSAB 22 of 2021 - Public Service Appeal Board - Commissioner T B Walkington - 7/02/2023.....	127
Industrial Law (WA) – Public Service Appeal Board – Application for extension of time – Factors to consider – Appeal prospects of success – Delay in commencing appeal – Reasons for delay – Unfair dismissal application filed in Fair Work Commission – Justice of the case – Appeal dismissed - Katica (Kathleen) Speciale -v- East Metropolitan Health Service - PSAB 67 of 2022 - Public Service Appeal Board - Senior Commissioner R Cosentino - 27/03/2023.....	384
Public Service Appeal Board – No good reason for delay – Time to appeal not extended - Leah Purser -v- Director General, Department of Justice - PSAB 63 of 2022 - Public Service Appeal Board - Commissioner T Emmanuel - 3/04/2023.....	39
Public Service Appeal Board – Jurisdiction – Whether appealable decision – Whether decision to suspend under s 82 Public Sector Management Act 1994 (WA) – Access Restriction Period – Exclusion from workplace coinciding with disciplinary process – Whether exclusion from workplace was part of the disciplinary process – No decision to suspend under s 82 – Appeal dismissed - Zachary James Alach -v- Department of Health - PSAB 48 of 2022 - Public Service Appeal Board - Senior Commissioner R Cosentino - 14/04/2023.....	496
Industrial Law (WA) - Public Service Appeal Board - Appeal under s 80I(1) of the Industrial Relations Act 1979 (WA) - Application for extension of time - Extension granted - Dismissal - Failure to comply with health and safety duty - Excessive use of employer resources - Dismissal substantiated - Appeal dismissed - Robert Goddard -v- Governing Council of North Metropolitan TAFE - PSAB 60 of 2022 - Public Service Appeal Board - Commissioner C Tsang - 5/05/2023.....	488
Public Service Appeal Board – Dismissal – Mandatory requirement to wear a face covering or mask – Lawful direction to return to work wearing a mask and to declare vaccination status – Employee absent from work without authorisation – Procedural fairness – Dismissal proportional response to conduct – Decision to dismiss upheld - Application dismissed - Safeta Kos -v- Director General, Department of Transport - PSAB 64 of 2022 - Public Service Appeal Board - Commissioner T Kucera - 18/05/2023.....	682
COMMISSIONER	
Work Health and Safety Tribunal – Recusal application – No actual bias – No apprehended bias – Recusal application dismissed - Robert Tasman Gates -v- Worksafe western Australia - OSHT 4 of 2022 - Commissioner T Emmanuel - 18/08/2022.....	395
Work Health and Safety Tribunal – Jurisdictional objection upheld – Operative reason for absence from the workplace because of employee’s exclusion, not refusal to work – Substantive application dismissed - Brianna Conti-Nibali -v- Main Roads - OSHT 1 of 2022 - Commissioner T Emmanuel - 15/12/2022.....	56
Work Health and Safety Tribunal – Refusal to work under s 26(1) of the Occupational Safety and Health Act 1984 (WA) – Application for pay and benefits – Refusal to be vaccinated against COVID-19 was not a refusal to work – No entitlement to pay and benefits because applicant was unable to lawfully perform his usual work – Application dismissed - Julian Cosentino -v- Director General, Department of Education - OSHT 3 of 2022 - Commissioner T Emmanuel - 15/12/2022.....	61
Application for matter to be dismissed under s 27(1)(a) of the Industrial Relations Act 1979 (WA) – Applicant bound by agreement made in related application before the Commission – Finding there was valid consideration and that it would not be in accordance with equity and good conscience for the matter to proceed – Application for matter to be dismissed upheld – Substantive application dismissed - Jade Smith -v- Minister for Corrective Services - APPL 9 of 2022 - Commissioner T Emmanuel - 16/12/2022.....	51
Industrial law (WA) - Application under s 66 - State union Rules no longer aligned with federal WA Branch Rules - Section 71 certificate likely to be no longer effective - Interim Branch Executive established - Order issued - Steven McCartney -v- The Automotive, Food, Metals, Engineering, Printing & Kindred Industries Union of Workers - Western Australian Branch - PRES 12 of 2022 - Chief Commissioner S J Kenner - 22/12/2022.....	18
Industrial law - Application under section 66 - Waiver of Rules to enable Executive Committee meetings - Rule to be waived - Order issued - The Construction, Forestry, Mining and Energy Union of Workers -v- Building Trades Association of Unions of Western Australia (Association of Workers) - PRES 14 of 2022 - Chief Commissioner S J Kenner - 9/01/2023.....	22
Interpretation of sub-cl 48.2 of the Department of Justice Prison Officers’ Industrial Agreement 2020 – Approach to be taken when interpreting an industrial agreement – Clause unambiguous and no need to strain for meaning - Western Australian Prison Officers’ Union of Workers -v- Minister for Corrective Services - APPL 15 of 2022 - Commissioner T Emmanuel - 10/01/2023.....	93
28-day limitation period in s 29(2) does not apply to referrals made under s 78(2) - Penelope Anne Fagan -v- William (Bill) Johnston Minister for Corrective Services - APPL 36 of 2022 - Commissioner T Emmanuel - 10/01/2023.....	159
Industrial Law (WA) – Application to vary award – Increasing allowances – Deletion of respondents no longer trading or no longer in existence – Updating respondent’s details - Electrical Trades Union WA -v- Hincó Engineering and Others - APPL 52 of 2022 - Senior Commissioner R Cosentino - 16/01/2023.....	82
Industrial Law (WA) – Application to vary award – Increasing allowances – Deletion of respondents no longer trading or no longer in existence – Updating respondent’s details - Electrical Trades Union WA -v- Albany Tv Services and Others - APPL 54 of 2022 - Senior Commissioner R Cosentino - 16/01/2023.....	89
Industrial Law (WA) – Application to vary award – Increasing allowances – Deletion of respondents no longer trading or no longer in existence – Updating respondent’s details - Electrical Trades Union WA -v- Wormald Security Controls and Others - APPL 55 of 2022 - Senior Commissioner R Cosentino - 16/01/2023.....	78
Industrial law WA - Contractual benefit claim - Overcycle payment - Additional days worked - Operational requirements - COVID-19 - Rest and recreation - Discretion to change roster - Flexibility clauses - Applicant did not comply with processes - No finding of denied contractual benefit - Ashley Stewart -v- Ugl Operations & Maintenance Pty Ltd - B 6 of 2021 - Commissioner C Tsang - 1/02/2023.....	102
Industrial law (WA) - Application under s 66 - Application for waiver of union Rules - Abolition of federal counterpart - Waiver necessary to allow officers to exercise powers, functions, and duties - Election required prior to issue of section 71 certificate - Rule to be waived - Order issued - Paul Bergesio -v- United Workers Union (WA) - PRES 13 of 2022 - Chief Commissioner S J Kenner - 17/02/2023.....	230
Unfair Dismissal; genuine redundancy; dismissed employee replaced - Gayle Priscilla Tawha -v- Nullagine Community Resource Centre Incorporated - U 23 of 2021 - Commissioner T B Walkington - 17/02/2023.....	221
Unfair dismissal; whether employee resigned; employment terminated at the initiative of the employer; reduction of hours of work in breach of contract - Te Arai Tawha -v- Nullagine Community Resource Centre Association - U 34 of 2021 - Commissioner T B Walkington - 17/02/2023.....	225
Industrial Law (WA) – Application to vary award – Increasing allowances – Glover scope clause – Retaining deregistered respondents - Electrical Trades Union WA -v- Cai Fences Pty Ltd And Others - APPL 1 of 2023 - Senior Commissioner R Cosentino - 27/02/2023 ...	215

CUMULATIVE DIGEST—continued

	Page
COMMISSIONER—continued	
Industrial Law (WA) - Unfair dismissal - Inadequate supervision of student resulting in injury - Physical contact with student not justifiable by Regulation 38 of the School Education Regulations 2000 (WA) - Procedural fairness - Dismissal not harsh, oppressive or unfair - The State School Teachers' Union of W.A. (Inc.) -v- Director General, Department of Education - CR 33 of 2021 - Commissioner C Tsang - 2/03/2023	639
Occupational health and safety – review of Worksafe Commissioner’s decision – improvement notice – improvement notice revoked - Ramsay Health Care Australia Pty Ltd -v- Worksafe Western Australia - OSHT 9 of 2021 - Commissioner T B Walkington - 7/03/2023	256
Contractual benefits claim – terms of contract – notice period – probation – Fair Work Act 2009 (Cth) – national employment standards – minimum standards - Neil Mortimore -v- ALOSCA Technologies Pty Ltd - B 68 of 2022 - Commissioner T B Walkington - 8/03/2023	329
Industrial Law (WA) – Enterprise Order pursuant to s 421 – Meaning of ‘employer’ in s 42 – Whether the applicant was an employer entitled to initiate bargaining at relevant time – Consideration of relevant factors – Higher base rate as trade-off for shift penalties and overtime – Whether proposed Enterprise Order is fair and reasonable in all of the circumstances - George Kourtesis as trustee for The Kourtesis Family Trust -v- United Workers Union - APPL 43 of 2022 - Senior Commissioner R Cosentino - 30/03/2023	343
Reviewable decision - restricted asbestos removal licence - insufficient verifiable experience - extension of time - Robert Tasman Gates -v- Worksafe Western Australia - OSHT 4 of 2022 - Commissioner T Emmanuel - 6/04/2023	395
Industrial Law (WA) – Denied Contractual Benefit Claim – Childcare Educator – Whether entitled to lump sum for pro rata long service leave – Long Service Leave Policy incorporated in contract – Construction of Policy – Meaning of ‘long service leave entitlement accrued’ - Nivritee Ah Fong -v- The University Child Care Club Inc. - B 78 of 2022 - Senior Commissioner R Cosentino - 14/04/2023	458
Industrial law (WA) - Application under s 66 - Inconsistency between State and federal union rules - Section 71(5) certificate no longer satisfied - Interim Union Council established - Proposed rule changes before the Registrar - Extension of order sought - Chief Commissioner functus officio - Order issued - Tiffany Venning -v- Media, Entertainment and Arts Alliance Western Australia (Union of Employees) - PRES 1 of 2023 - Chief Commissioner S J Kenner - 18/04/2023	467
Jurisdiction to hear and determine application – whether employees of national system employers may refer a matter to the Tribunal – ss 26 and 28 of the Occupational Safety and Health Act 1984 (WA) – ss 19, 26, 27 and 474 of the Fair Work Act 2009 (Cth) – refusal to work – concerns for health and safety – industrial action – entitlement to payment - Russell Carradus -v- Patricks Stevedoring Holdings Pty Ltd, Attorney General for Western Australia - Intervenor - OSHT 7 of 2021 - Commissioner T B Walkington - 19/04/2023	504
Contractual Benefits claim – salary – profit share – annual leave – entitlements – gift – casual – full-time employee – variation of contract - Caitlyn Church -v- Wild Squeeze - B 80 of 2022 - Commissioner T B Walkington - 21/04/2023	434
Industrial Law (WA) – Unfair dismissal application – Whether respondent conducted a full and extensive investigation into the alleged misconduct – Procedural fairness – Failure of employee to comply with Employer Direction to be vaccinated against COVID-19 – Dismissal not harsh, oppressive or unfair - David Mills -v- South Metropolitan Tafe - U 53 of 2022 - Commissioner C Tsang - 21/04/2023	438
Unfair dismissal – termination of employment – jurisdiction – national system employer – trading corporation – trading activities of organisation – declaration made – jurisdiction found - Lynda Marzia Genovesi -v- The Patricia Giles Centre INC - U 81 of 2022 - Commissioner T B Walkington - 21/04/2023	455
Industrial Law (WA) – Award variations on Commission’s Own Motion under s 40B – Farm Employees Award 1985 – Outdated provisions – Minimum Conditions of Employment Act 1993 (WA) - Commission’s Own Motion -v- (Not Applicable) - APPL 58 of 2022 - Senior Commissioner R Cosentino - 8/05/2023	570
Application for external review – stay on Improvement Notice – stay principles – stay application granted - Clinical Laboratories (WA) Pty Ltd -v- The Government of Western Australia’s Department of Mines, Industry Regulation and Safety - WHST 3 of 2023 - Commissioner T Emmanuel - 11/05/2023	717
Industrial law (WA) – Denied contractual benefits claim – Jurisdictional object – Evergreen contracts – Excluded and non-excluded claims – The Commission’s jurisdiction in denied contractual benefits claims involving national system employees – Unfair contracts jurisdiction in other States – Statutory interpretation – Excluded and non-excluded claims – Relevance of evidence – Jurisdiction found - Peter Watkins -v- ATG Bunbury Pty Ltd as trustee for ATG Bunbury Unit Trust - B 105 of 2022 - Commissioner T Kucera - 19/05/2023	629
Industrial law (WA) – Denied contractual benefits claim – Withdrawal or discontinuance of application – Application discontinued before matter was set down for hearing – Commission functus officio – Application for costs – Commission’s powers to award costs – Whether there were “exceptional circumstances” where a costs order would be appropriate – No jurisdiction to award costs – Order for costs not justified – Costs not awarded - Inger Isaksen -v- South West Transit Group Pty Ltd as trustee for the South West Transit Group Unit Trust - B 106 of 2022 - Commissioner T Kucera - 19/05/2023	624
Industrial Law (WA) – Contractual Benefit Claim – Applicant failed to attend several conciliation conference listings and directions hearing – s 27(1)(a) – Applicant failed to diligently prosecute his claim – Further proceedings not in public interest – Application dismissed - Rhys Schoen -v- Paull & Warner Resources PTY LTD - B 4 of 2023 - Senior Commissioner R Cosentino - 22/05/2023	636
Industrial Law (WA) - Jurisdiction - Endorsement of employment file not to be permitted future employment without prior reference to the Director, Standards and Integrity - Whether endorsement of employment file is a decision to take disciplinary action - Matters an individual may refer to the Commission - Estoppel - James Thomas Waterton -v- Director General, Department of Education - APPL 42 of 2021 - Commissioner C Tsang - 29/05/2023	693
Industrial Law (WA) – Chief Health Officer WA Correctional Facility Entrant (Restrictions on Access) Directions – Employer Direction to be vaccinated against COVID-19 not complied with – Breach of discipline – Decision to dismiss made under s 82A(3)(b) of the Public Sector Management Act 1994 (WA) – Subjective reasons for not complying with the Employer Direction – Whether subjective belief lessens culpability – Seriousness/gravity of conduct – Breach of discipline warranted dismissal – Inconsistent treatment of employees – Applicant treated differently from comparable employee in similar circumstances – Dismissal harsh – Reinstatement ordered – Quantum of compensation for remuneration lost to be determined - Penelope Anne Fagan -v- William (Bill) Johnston Minister for Corrective Services - APPL 36 of 2022 - Senior Commissioner R Cosentino - 13/06/2023	700
POLICE APPEAL	
Industrial Law (WA) – Dismissal from WA Police Force – Police Appeal Board affirmed dismissal – Whether appeal lies under s 33P – Whether dismissal is ‘removal action’ – No right of appeal to Commission – Appeal dismissed - Levente Kovacs -v- Western Australia Police Force - APPL 53 of 2022 - Police Appeal - Senior Commissioner R Cosentino Commissioner T Emmanuel Commissioner T Kucera - 9/03/2023	326