

CUMULATIVE DIGEST

MATTERS REFERRED TO IN DECISIONS OF THE INDUSTRIAL APPEAL COURT, INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS COMMISSION AND INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATES COURT CONTAINED IN VOL. 95 PART 1, SUB PARTS 1 - 6.

Digest Headings

* Denotes New Heading

Industrial Appeal Court	Public Service Appeal Board
Full Bench	Public Service Arbitrator
Commission In Court Session	Commissioner
President	Board of Reference
Industrial Magistrate	Police Appeal

Page

Editor's Note: The Registrar wishes to advise that as from January 2004, the format of the "Cumulative Digest" published at the back of the Western Australian Industrial Gazette has changed to incorporate "Catchword Phrases", please refer to the Notice at (83WAIG3937).

All documents within the above headings are in chronological order.

INDUSTRIAL APPEAL COURT

Industrial Appeal Court - Whether court has jurisdiction to hear appeal - Appeal Dismissed - Polizzi -v- Commissioner of Police - IAC 2 of 2014 - Industrial Appeal Court - Buss J/Murphy J/Le Miere J - 11/03/2014	323
Industrial Relations - Working with Children (Criminal Record Checking) Act 2004 (WA) - Principle of legality - Statutory construction - Restricting rights under the Industrial Relations Act 1979 (WA) - Defining 'reason' - Appeal dismissed - Charles Brett -v- Sharyn O'Neill, Director General, Department of Education - IAC 3 of 2014 - Industrial Appeal Court - BUSS J/LE MIERE J/MURPHY J - 07/04/2015	429

FULL BENCH

Industrial Law (WA) - Appeal against decision of the Commission - A finding of fact in reasons for decision distinguished from a finding that does not finally decide, determine or dispose of the matter in question within the meaning of the definition of finding in s 7(1) and s 49(2a) of the Industrial Relations Act 1979 - Whether findings of fact were made by the Commission at first instance that employees had conducted themselves dishonestly in an investigation - Turns on own facts and the questions put in issue 3 referred for hearing and determination - Questions put in issue 3 not answered at first instance - Appeal dismissed. - The Australian Rail, Tram and Bus Industry Union of Employees, West Australian Branch -v- Public Transport Authority of Western Australia - FBA 11 of 2014 - Full Bench - The Honourable J H Smith, Acting President/Chief Commissioner A R Beech/Acting Senior Commissioner P E Scott - 19/12/2014	1
Industrial Law (WA) - Appeal against decision of the Commission - Effect of non-compliance with time limit in s 49(3) of the Industrial Relations Act 1979 (WA) - Whether power to extend time to institute an appeal considered - Time limit in s 49(3) procedural - Power to extend time expressly prescribed in s 27(1)(n) of the Act - Time extended - Commission at first instance dismissed the application on grounds the relief sought by the union was for enforcement of an industrial instrument - Nature of exclusive jurisdiction of the Industrial Magistrate's Court considered - Commission without power to make declarations sought by the union - Order sought by the union within power - Appeal allowed - Order made at first instance suspended and case remitted for further hearing and determination - United Voice WA -v- The Director General, Department of Education - FBA 9 of 2014 - Full Bench - The Honourable J H Smith, Acting President/Chief Commissioner A R Beech/Commissioner S J Kenner - 18/12/2014	13
Industrial Law (WA) - s 53(1) of the Industrial Relations Act 1979 (WA) - Application for registration of employees - Overlapping eligibility for membership of applicant and an existing representative organisation raised - Construction of s 55(5) considered - Good reason consistent with the objects of the Industrial Relations Act 1979 to permit registration of the applicant - Principals' Federation of Western Australia -v- THE STATE SCHOOL TEACHERS' UNION OF W.A. (INCORPORATED) - FBM 8 of 2011 - Full Bench - The Honourable J H Smith, Acting President/Acting Senior Commissioner P E Scott/Commissioner S J Kenner - 17/12/2014.....	42
Industrial Law (WA) - Appeal against decision of the Commission - Industrial matter - Claim of contractual benefits by an employee - Appeal conceded - Commissioner erred in finding an implied term about a motor vehicle allowance - Commissioner erred in failing to apply correct principles of law - Commissioner erred in the assessment of the evidence - Commission's power to make an award of compensation in the form of damages for breach of a term of contract considered - New point raised on appeal - New point cannot be raised when evidence could be called to meet the point - Decision suspended - Matter remitted for further hearing and determination - Alfresco Concepts Pty Ltd -v- Troy Patrick Franse - FBA 12 of 2014 - Full Bench - The Honourable J H Smith, Acting President/Chief Commissioner A R Beech/Commissioner J L Harrison - 20/03/2015.....	437
Industrial Law (WA) - Application to cancel the registration of an organisation on grounds of the number of employees and members of the organisation would not entitle it to registration and the organisation is defunct - The Registrar, Western Australian Industrial Relations Commission -v- Salaried Pharmacists' Association Western Australian Union of Workers - FBM 2 of 2015 - Full Bench - The Honourable J H Smith, Acting President/Chief Commissioner A R Beech/Commissioner S M Mayman - 21/04/2015	517
Industrial Law (WA) - Application to cancel the registration of an organisation on grounds of the number of employees and members of the organisation would not entitle it to registration and the organisation is defunct - The Registrar, Western Australian Industrial Relations Commission -v- W.A. Dental Technicians' and Employees' Union of Workers, Perth - FBM 1 of 2015 - Full Bench - The Honourable J H Smith, Acting President/Chief Commissioner A R Beech/Commissioner S M Mayman - 21/04/2015.....	520
Industrial Law (WA) - Application to cancel the registration of an organisation on grounds that the number of employees and members of the organisation would not entitle it to registration and the organisation is defunct - The Registrar, Western Australian Industrial Relations Commission -v- West Australian Branch, Australasian Meat Industry Employees Union, Industrial Union of Workers, Perth - FBM 3 of 2015 - Full Bench - The Honourable J H Smith, Acting President/Chief Commissioner A R Beech/Commissioner J L Harrison - 20/04/2015	523

CUMULATIVE DIGEST—continued

	Page
COMMISSION IN COURT SESSION	
Commission in Court Session – WA Health – HSUWA – PACTS Industrial Agreement 2014 – Arbitration of salary increases in industrial agreement – Public Sector Wages Policy Statement 2014 – State of WA economy – Government expenditure – Principal objects of the Act – WA public health system – Timing of the implementation of the government wages policy – Equity in salary rates – Internal equities – Comparison salary increases of registered nurses and medical practitioners – Productivity and efficiency improvements – Changes within the public health system – 4 Hour Rule – National Emergency Access Target (NEAT) – Overall fairness - The Minister for Health in his incorporated capacity under s.7 of the Hospitals and Health Services Act 1927 (WA) as the Hospitals formerly comprised in the Metropolitan Health Service Board, the Peel -v- Health Services Union of Western Australia (Union of Workers) - PSAAG 19 of 2014 - Commission in Court Session - Chief Commissioner A R Beech/Acting Senior Commissioner P E Scott/Commissioner S M Mayman - 10/02/2015.....	526
State Wage order - Commission's own motion - Minimum wage for employees under Minimum Conditions of Employment Act 1993 - Award rates of wage - Award minimum wage - State wage principles - on the commission's Own Motion -v- (Not applicable) - APPL 1 of 2015 - Commission in Court Session - Chief Commissioner A R Beech/Acting Senior Commissioner P E Scott/Commissioner S J Kenner/Commissioner J L Harrison/Commissioner S M Mayman - 11/06/2015.....	679
PRESIDENT	
Industrial Law (WA) - Application pursuant to s 66 of the Industrial Relations Act 1979 (WA) for an order for an interim board of directors - variation and waiver of union rules pending changes to the rules of the organisation and a new s 71 certificate - George Tilbury -v- Western Australian Police Union of Workers - PRES 1 of 2015 - President - The Honourable J H Smith, Acting President - 21/05/2015	705
INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATE	
Allegation that the Respondent has failed to comply with the Western Australian Police Service Enterprise Agreement for Police Act Employees 2003; Claim alleging non-payment of wages in the amount of \$30,000.00; Claim for \$30,000.00 plus interest; Interlocutory application seeking dismissal of Claim on the basis that the Claim is statute barred. - Peter Milford Weston -v- Commissioner of Police - M 150 of 2014 - Industrial Magistrate - INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATE G. CICCHINI - 17/12/2014.....	133
Claimants assert entitlement to four weeks' paid annual leave per year of service as full-time employees under the Minimum Conditions of Employment Act 1993 (WA), the Workplace Relations Act 1996 (Cth), and the Fair Work Act 2009 (Cth); Whether accrued annual leave should have been paid on termination of employment; Whether the Claimants, engaged as Sales Consultants by the Respondent, were remunerated wholly by commission or percentage reward; Whether the Claimants were entirely remunerated by incentive-based payments; Whether the Claimants took annual leave in any event; Whether the claims fall outside the limitation periods; Whether annual leave accrued during periods of leave taken; Whether the quantum claimed was appropriately calculated. - Hugh Sutherland Rogers; Andjelko Budimlich -v- J-Corp Pty Ltd; J-Corp Pty Ltd - M 47 of 2013 and M 48 of 2013 - Industrial Magistrate - INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATE G. CICCHINI - 21/01/2015	267
Claim re alleged breach of the Children and Community Services Act 2004 - Conviction entered, penalty imposed - Sentencing Remarks issued - William Alan Bassett, Department of Commerce -v- MMG (WA) Pty Ltd trading as Jurien IGA ACN 115 257 139 - CP 1 of 2014 - Industrial Magistrate - INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATE G. CICCHINI - 22/01/2015	279
Alleged failure to comply with Educational Services (Post-Secondary Education) Award 2010; claim alleging underpayment - Kyra Phillips -v- MVJ Enterprises Pty Ltd - M 186 of 2013 - Industrial Magistrate - INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATE G. CICCHINI - 26/02/2015	329
Respondent employer's application for costs pursuant to section 570 of the Fair Work Act 2009; Claimant successful at Trial on liability but largely unsuccessful as to quantum; whether proceedings instituted without reasonable cause; whether Claimant's unreasonable act or omission caused the Respondent to incur costs; whether proper cause for the award of costs. - Kyra Phillips -v- MVJ Enterprises Pty Ltd - M 186 of 2013 - Industrial Magistrate - INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATE G. CICCHINI - 1/04/2015	459
Construction of Clause 32 of the Child and Adolescent Health Service, North Metropolitan Area Health Service, South Metropolitan Area Health Service Orthopaedic Trauma Surgery Roster Agreement (2011) - Dr Li-On Lam; Dr T Leys; Dr M Scaddon; Prof Richard Carey Smith -v- The Minister for Health in his incorporated capacity under s.7 of the Hospitals and Health Service Act 1927 (WA) as the Hospitals formerly comprised in the Metropolitan Health Service Board - M 125 of 2012 and M 126 of 2012 and M 127 of 2012 and M 128 of 2012 - Industrial Magistrate - INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATE G. CICCHINI - 22/04/2015	549
Whether the Claimant was an employee for the purposes of the Long Service Leave Act 1958; Whether the Public Transport Authority Railway Employees (Transperth Train Operations) Industrial Agreement 2011 governed the Claimant's long service leave entitlements; Whether the entitlement to long service leave under the Agreement is at least equivalent to the entitlement under the Long Service Leave Act 1958. - Junghee Yoon -v- The Public Transport Authority - M 5 of 2015 - Industrial Magistrate - INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATE G. CICCHINI - 28/05/2015	730
PUBLIC SERVICE APPEAL BOARD	
Industrial law (WA) - Appeal against the respondent's decision to terminate the appellant's employment on the grounds of breach of discipline - Government Regional Officers' Housing scheme - Subsidised rent - Residential tenancy agreement - Allegations of misconduct in connection with a residential tenancy - Payments made to the appellant for accommodation - Allegations of subletting - Investigation - Findings of misconduct -Principles applied - Consideration of the Residential Tenancies Act 1987 (WA) - Subtenant, boarder or lodger - Occupier was not a tenant - Claim within jurisdiction - Failure to disclose payments received - Concealment - Value of the payments substantially exceeded the rent - Subsidised housing used for personal gain - Breach of the duty of fidelity and good faith - Breach of the Public Sector Management Act 1994 (WA), the Public Sector Code of Ethics and the Department's Code of Conduct - Appeal dismissed - Order made - The Civil Service Association of Western Australia Incorporated on behalf of Emma Hazelton -v- Director General, Department of Housing - PSAB 5 of 2014 - Public Service Appeal Board - Commissioner S J Kenner - 31/10/2014	196
PUBLIC SERVICE ARBITRATOR	
Public Service Arbitrator – Matter referred for hearing and determination pursuant to s 44 – Contract of employment – Medical practitioner – Claim for damages for loss of earnings during suspension – On call and call back allowances – Loss of private practice income – Jurisdiction of the Public Service Arbitrator – Industrial matter – Enquire into and deal with – Denied contractual benefit – Whether the terms of the Agreement are imported into the contract – Suspension on full pay and pay as if attended for duty – Application of the rules of evidence – Unfair treatment – Delay in return to work – Ready, willing and available - Australian Medical Association (WA) Incorporated -v- The Minister for Health - PSACR 30 of 2013 - Public Service Arbitrator - Acting Senior Commissioner P E Scott - 12/01/2015	163
Industrial law (WA) – Reclassification appeals – Representation by a legal practitioner – Questions of law raised – Procedural fairness – Leave granted for the appellants to be represented by a legal practitioner - Mario Volonnino; Jaclyn Stillitano -v- The Commissioner Department of Corrective Services - PSA 2 of 2014 and PSA 3 of 2014 - Public Service Arbitrator - Commissioner S J Kenner - 18/09/2014	483
Industrial law (WA) - Reclassification appeals - Significant net addition to work value - Previous reclassification decision of the Arbitrator - Principles applied - No substantial increase in work value on the evidence - Workload issue - Appeals dismissed - Order made - Mario Volonnino; Jaclyn Stillitano -v- The Commissioner Department of Corrective Services - PSA 2 of 2014 and PSA 3 of 2014 - Public Service Arbitrator - Commissioner S J Kenner - 6/03/2015.....	485

CUMULATIVE DIGEST—*continued*

	Page
PUBLIC SERVICE ARBITRATOR—<i>continued</i>	
Public Service Arbitrator – Application to amend the current application – Non-renewal of contract – Fixed term contract – Denial of procedural fairness – Unlawful and unfair suspension – Industrial matter – Medical practitioner – Dispute settlement procedure – Jurisdiction – Powers of the Public Service Arbitrator – Public Service Arbitrator’s jurisdiction compared to Public Service Appeal Board – Employment Standard – Government officer – Australian Medical Association (WA) Incorporated -v- The Minister for Health – PSAC 20 of 2013 – Public Service Arbitrator – Acting Senior Commissioner P E Scott – 23/04/2015	590
Industrial law (WA) – Dispute regarding application and interpretation of the Alcohol and Other Drugs Policy – Positive test for the presence of alcohol – Reasonableness of the policy – Interpretation of 0.00% BAC in the policy – Principles applied – Assessment of the policy against acceptable industrial standards – Policy found to be reasonable – Legislation sets minimum obligations – Purpose and intention of the policy – Positive result under the policy – Recommendation issued – Western Australian Municipal, Administrative, Clerical and Services Union of Employees -v- Public Transport Authority – PSAC 23 of 2014 – Public Service Arbitrator – Commissioner S J Kenner – 1/04/2015	600
COMMISSIONER	
Industrial law (WA) – Contractual benefits claim – employment pursuant to written employment agreement – Whether employer entitled to deduct statutory superannuation contributions from commission owed – Basis of calculation of commission – ascertainment of terms of contract of employment – Andjelko Budimlich Hugh Sutherland Rogers Expedit (Stan) Carvalho Adrian Van Der Meulen -v- J-Corp Pty Ltd – B 63 of 2013 and B 64 of 2013 and B 65 of 2013 and B 164 of 2013 – Chief Commissioner A R Beech – 23/12/2014.....	135
Termination of employment – Alleged harsh, oppressive and unfair dismissal – Application filed outside of 28 day time limit – Whether it is fair to accept application – Principles applied – Acceptance of application out of time – Michael Moore-Crouch -v- Goldfields Individual and Family Support Association (Inc.) t/as GIFSA – U 227 of 2014 – Chief Commissioner A R Beech – 18/12/2014.....	147
Industrial law (WA) – Termination of employment – Harsh, oppressive and unfair dismissal – Absence from work due to illness – Conduct and behaviour of an employee – Casual employment – Principles applied – Employed on an ongoing and continuous basis – Ongoing working relationship untenable – Breach of the duty of good faith and cooperation – Application dismissed – Order made – Kellie Stratton -v- Hidden Valley Handcrafts – U 112 of 2014 – Commissioner S J Kenner – 14/11/2014	154
Industrial law (WA) – Termination of employment – Harsh, oppressive and unfair dismissal – Prison chaplain banned from prisons – Decision of the Superintendent of a prison – Principles applied – Frustration of the contract of employment – No dismissal – Application dismissed – Order made – Chacko (James) Varkey -v- The Roman Catholic Archbishop of Perth Corporation Sole ABN No. 96 993 674 415 – U 113 of 2014 – Commissioner S J Kenner – 3/12/2014.....	159
Industrial law (WA) – Reclassification appeal – Work value change – Change in the nature of duties and responsibilities – Principles applied – Lack of fundamental change – Reclassification not warranted – Application dismissed – United Voice WA -v- The Minister for Health in his incorporated capacity under s7 of the Hospitals and Health Services Act 1927 (WA) as the hospitals formerly comprised in the Metropolitan Health Service Board – CR 233 of 2013 – Commissioner S J Kenner – 3/10/2014.....	178
Denied contractual entitlements – Summary dismissal for serious misconduct – Payment in lieu of notice – Contract of employment – Interpretation of contractual terms – Breach of employment contract – Condonation – Anja Rossouw -v- Peta Bennett Investments Pty Ltd – B 135 of 2014 – Acting Senior Commissioner P E Scott – 20/01/2015.....	288
Matter Referred for Hearing and Determination pursuant to s 44 – Termination of employment – Breach of discipline – Delegation of power – Whether the dismissal was made without legal authority – Whether the decision maker had the necessary delegated authority or subdelegation – The State School Teachers’ Union of Western Australia (Incorporated) -v- The Governing Council of Kimberley Training Institute – CR 34 of 2014 – Acting Senior Commissioner P E Scott – 2/02/2015	298
Occupational Safety and Health Act 1984 – Further review by Tribunal under s 51A – Jurisdiction – Whether a referral can refer more than one improvement notice for further review – Relevant context and nature of the review by WorkSafe Western Australia Commissioner and further review by Tribunal – Interpretation of s 51A(1) – Amendment of referral – Documentary discovery – Reece Pty Ltd -v- The WorkSafe Western Australia Commissioner – OSH 3 of 2014 – Chief Commissioner A R Beech – 2/02/2015.....	306
Industrial law – Termination of employment – Applicant summarily dismissed – Relevant principles applied – Applicant unfairly dismissed – Patrick Edward Connor -v- The Trustee for the Fanchetti Family Trust T/A Fusha Hair and Beauty – U 119 of 2014 – Commissioner S M Mayman – 3/03/2015.....	339
Industrial law (WA) – Contractual benefits claim – Whether the Commission has jurisdiction – Characterisation of the claim – Claim for leave – Claim for ordinary wage or salary – Whether the claimed denied contractual benefits arise under the contract of employment – Principles applied – Non-excluded matter – Incorporation of an award – Ready, willing and able – Above award wage – Jurisdiction found – Declaration that the Commission has jurisdiction to hear the claim – Tracey Louise Fergusson -v- The Salvation Army (Western Australia) Property Trust as the Trustee for The Salvation Army (WA) Social Work trading as Salvos Stores – B 44 of 2014 – Commissioner S J Kenner – 22/09/2014	348
Termination of employment – Claim of harsh, oppressive and unfair dismissal – Application referred outside of 28 day time limit – Relevant principles to be applied – Commission concluded applying principles that discretion should not be exercised – Application dismissed – Sandra Petrich -v- Gentlemens Hair Lounge – U 183 of 2014 and B 183 of 2014 – Commissioner S M Mayman – 20/02/2015.....	359
Denied contractual entitlements – Payment of wages – Contract of employment – Norman William Tower -v- James Sinclair Thomson – Trading as Mundaring Hire Service / J.S.T Projects – B 219 of 2014 – Acting Senior Commissioner P E Scott – 17/02/2015.....	362
Termination of employment – Claim of harsh, oppressive or unfair dismissal – Termination due to redundancy – Principles applied – Applicant not harshly, oppressively or unfairly dismissed – Application dismissed – Charles Tysoe -v- The Owners of Strathearn SP 1082 ABN 37397560589 C/- Smithwick Strata Services ABN 36995277562 – U 191 of 2014 – Commissioner J L Harrison – 17/02/2015	364
Industrial Law – Unfair dismissal application – Procedural application by respondent to part dismiss on public interest grounds – Relevant principles applied – Application part dismissed – Remaining matters: whether respondent had reasonable grounds to determine applicant was guilty of the misconduct alleged, procedural fairness and penalty. – The Australian Rail, Tram and Bus Industry Union of Employees, West Australian Branch -v- The Public Transport Authority of Western Australia – CR 32 of 2014 – Commissioner S M Mayman – 11/03/2015	371
Industrial law (WA) – contractual benefits claim – employment pursuant to written employment agreement – provision for a housing allowance non-taxable – whether misrepresentation of taxability of the housing allowance – whether provision actionable – mistake on matter of law – whether provision of allowance non-taxable void for illegality – whether employee entitled to receive full amount of housing allowance – whether claim is an industrial matter – Stephan Curr -v- Coates Hire Operations Pty Ltd – B 214 of 2014 – Chief Commissioner A R Beech – 5/02/2015	463
Unfair dismissal – Application for discovery – Communications to and between Board members – Relevance – Volunteer board members – Confidentiality of Board members’ communications – Fishing – Sandra Boulter -v- Mental Health Law Centre (WA) Inc – U 247 of 2014 – Acting Senior Commissioner P E Scott – 26/03/2015	477
Industrial law (WA) – Agreement – Interpretation of clauses of the Public Transport Authority (Transperth Train Operations Rail Car Drivers) Industrial Agreement 2013 – Interpretation of cls 3.1.1, 3.1.2 and 6.7 – Principles applied – Method of rostering drivers who take annual leave – Terms of the Agreement read as a whole – Standard hours and ordinary hours – Declaration issued – The Australian Rail, Tram and Bus Industry Union of Employees, West Australian Branch -v- Public Transport Authority of Western Australia – APPL 36 of 2014 – Commissioner S J Kenner – 21/04/2015	545

