

CUMULATIVE DIGEST

MATTERS REFERRED TO IN DECISIONS OF THE INDUSTRIAL APPEAL COURT, INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS COMMISSION AND INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATES COURT CONTAINED IN VOL. 96 PART 2, SUB PARTS 1 - 9.

Digest Headings

* Denotes New Heading

Industrial Appeal Court	Public Service Appeal Board
Full Bench	Public Service Arbitrator
Commission In Court Session	Commissioner
President	Board of Reference
Industrial Magistrate	Police Appeal

	Page
Editor's Note: The Registrar wishes to advise that as from January 2004, the format of the "Cumulative Digest" published at the back of the Western Australian Industrial Gazette has changed to incorporate "Catchword Phrases", please refer to the Notice at (83WAIG3937).	
All documents within the above headings are in chronological order.	

FULL BENCH

Industrial Law (WA) - Appeal against decision of public service arbitrator - Doctor aggrieved by decision not to offer him a further contract following the expiry of a fixed term contract - Rules of procedural fairness that apply to decision by application of the principles of administrative law did not apply as any right of the doctor to a further contract derived from contract and not from a statutory power - The claim of procedural fairness as a part of industrial unfairness also considered - Employer had a right unfettered by procedural fairness to determine whether to offer a further contract - No industrial unfairness demonstrated as no special circumstances raised to displace this right - Australian Medical Association (WA) Incorporated -v- The Minister for Health - FBA 1 of 2016 - Full Bench - The Honourable J H Smith, Acting President/Senior Commissioner S J Kenner/Commissioner T Emmanuel - 11/08/2016.....	1255
Industrial Law (WA) - Appeal against decision of Commission - Claim of contractual benefits - Appellant used interpreter at first instance - Claimed his evidence was mistranslated and respondent's evidence not translated to him - Principles relating to adequate translation of proceedings considered - Errors in translation found to be inconsequential - No error demonstrated in findings made that the Commission had no jurisdiction to hear and determine the appellant's claims on grounds appellant independent contractor and claims made out of time - Jason Zhou -v- Curtin University - FBA 17 of 2015 - Full Bench - The Honourable J H Smith, Acting President/Chief Commissioner P E Scott/Commissioner D J Matthews - 12/08/2016	1279
Industrial Law (WA) - Appeal against decision of Commission sitting as the Occupational Safety and Health Tribunal - Appellant carried out all work in Africa - Jurisdiction of Tribunal to hear and determine an application referred to it - Not satisfied Mines Safety and Inspection Act 1994 (WA) has extra-territorial effect - Even if an employee working overseas is able to refer a claim the nature of claims made by the appellant not within the Tribunal's jurisdiction - Andries Lucas Hoffman -v- Paladin Energy Ltd - FBA 7 of 2016 - Full Bench - The Honourable J H Smith, Acting President/Commissioner T Emmanuel/Commissioner D J Matthews - 18/08/2016	1337
Industrial Law (WA) - Appeals against decisions of Commission - Harsh, oppressive or unfair dismissal referred - Dismissals lawful but found to be unfair - Remedy - Discretion conferred by s 23A of the Industrial Relations Act 1979 (WA) to make an award of compensation considered - No error demonstrated - Mr Alan Scicluna -v- Mr William Paul Brooks T/AS Bayview Motel Esperance, WA - FBA 5 of 2016 and FBA 6 of 2016 - Full Bench - The Honourable J H Smith, Acting President/Chief Commissioner P E Scott/Commissioner T Emmanuel - 3/11/2016	1475
Industrial Law (WA) - Appeal against decision made by Industrial Magistrate's Court - Finding claimant's prior employment with related body corporates of the appellant and subsequent employment with the appellant was continuous employment with one and same employer for the purposes of calculating long service leave entitlements under s 8 of the Long Service Leave Act 1958 (WA) - Issue of construction of Long Service Leave Act - History of amendments made to Long Service Leave Act and Long Service Leave General Order considered - Error established - Words 'one and same employer' not unambiguous and do not include related bodies corporate - Far reaching 'gap' in 2006 amendments to Long Service Leave Act found that cannot be filled by reading words into s 8 of the Long Service Leave Act - Doctrine of piercing corporate veil considered - Baker Hughes Australia Pty Ltd (ABN 20 004 752 050) -v- Martin Venier - FBA 2 of 2016 - Full Bench - The Honourable J H Smith, Acting President/Chief Commissioner P E Scott/Commissioner D J Matthews - 26/10/2016.....	1488

COMMISSION IN COURT SESSION

State Wage order - Commission's own motion - Minimum wage for employees under Minimum Conditions of Employment Act 1993 - Award rates of wage - Award minimum wage - State wage principles - on the Commission's Own Motion -v- (Not applicable) - APPL 1 of 2016 - Commission in Court Session - Acting Senior Commissioner P E Scott/Commissioner S J Kenner/Commissioner T Emmanuel Commissioner D J Matthews - 10/06/2016.....	636
--	-----

INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATE

Claim for redundancy entitlement allegedly owed - Fair Work Act 2009 - Small claims procedure - Whether the claimant is by reason of her conduct estopped from claiming a redundancy benefit or other compensation - Whether the claimant was made redundant. - Lorraine Rice -v- AEG Ogden (Perth) Pty Ltd ABN 67 084 272 088 - M 113 of 2015 - Industrial Magistrate - INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATE G. CICCINI - 30/06/2016	669
Claim for unpaid wages - Whether the claimant and respondent entered into a contract of employment - Whether there was a breach of the Vehicle Manufacturing, Repair, Services and Retail Award 2010 [MA000089] - Small claims procedure. - Jing Tao Sun -v- Success Motors Service Pty Ltd - M 32 of 2015 - Industrial Magistrate - INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATE G. CICCINI - 28/07/2016	1293
Qantas Ground Services Pty Ltd Ground Handling Agreement 2013 - Alleged failure to pay cargo drivers a higher duties allowance - Whether a higher duty allowance is payable to a cargo driver who works without direct supervision - Whether the claimants performed cargo driving duties without direct supervision - Whether the claims are aimed at reclassification. - Noel Hardwick; William McGlue -v- Qantas Ground Services Pty Ltd; Qantas Ground Services Pty Ltd - M 172 of 2015 and M 173 of 2015 - Industrial Magistrate - INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATE G. CICCINI - 18/08/2016.....	1345

CUMULATIVE DIGEST—continued

	Page
INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATE—continued	
The Clerks - Private Sector Award 2010 [MA000002] (the Award) -Non-payment of overtime and lunch breaks allegedly worked - Preliminary issue - Whether the written contract of employment which makes provision for the payment of an annualised salary complies with clause 17(1)(b) of the Award - Whether the claim is ousted by the contract of employment which provides for the payment of annualised salary. - Simone Jade Stewart -v- Next Residential Pty Ltd - M 12 of 2016 - Industrial Magistrate - INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATE G. CICCHINI - 15/09/2016.....	1354
Adjournments - Marc Longley Jones -v- Clough Projects Pty. Ltd. - M 11 of 2016 - Industrial Magistrate - INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATE M.PONTIFEX - 21/09/2016	1408
Alleged contravention of the Fair Work Act 2009 and the Building and Construction General On-site Award 2010 [MA000020] by failing to pay annual leave entitlements, annual leave loading, public holiday and sick pay entitlements - Whether the claimant was a casual employee. - Vincent John Ciccarelli -v- Hazdra Pty Ltd T/AS Banken Building (ACN 009 262 006) - M 14 of 2016 - Industrial Magistrate - INDUSTRIAL MAGISTRATE G. CICCHINI - 7/12/2016	1584
INDUSTRIAL LAW - Application for imposition of pecuniary penalties - contravention of civil penalty provisions on accrued annual leave and amounts payable in relation to performance of work - accessory liability of directors - penalties imposed - costs and unreasonable act of unsuccessful respondent. - Daryl Bruce Spaul -v- Total Business Technology Pty Ltd, Luke Anderson, Alan Green - M 21 of 2016 - Industrial Magistrate - Industrial Magistrate M Flynn - 23/11/2016.....	1589
PUBLIC SERVICE APPEAL BOARD	
Industrial Law (WA) - Appeal against a decision of the respondent to undertake disciplinary action - Application for an extension of time in which to file the appeal - Whether the appeal is beyond the Public Service Appeal Board's jurisdiction in any event - Whether employee is a "government officer" for the purposes of s 80C(1) of the Industrial Relations Act 1979 - Principles applied - Extension of time cannot be granted where the substance of the appeal is beyond jurisdiction - Appeal dismissed - Mark Darryl Nelson -v- Public Transport Authority of Western Australia - PSAB 16 of 2016 - Public Service Appeal Board - Senior Commissioner S J Kenner - 19/10/2016.....	1567
PUBLIC SERVICE ARBITRATOR	
Industrial Law (WA) - Public Service Arbitrator - Industrial agreement providing that employer may supply uniforms and require them to be worn at all times when considered necessary by the employer - Arbitrator can vary an industrial agreement in limited circumstances - No power to vary an industrial agreement - Health Services Union of Western Australia (Union of Workers) -v- Director General of Health as delegate of The Minister for Health in his incorporated capacity under s7 of the Hospital and Health Services Act 1927 as the WA Country Health Service - PSACR 15 of 2015 - Public Service Arbitrator - Commissioner T Emmanuel - 12/09/2016.....	1373
Industrial Law (WA) - Jurisdiction of the Public Service Arbitrator - Whether an 'industrial matter' exists - Whether Arbitrator has power to make deeming orders - Whether orders sought vary an agreement - Whether jurisdiction is excluded - Whether orders sought are in the public interest - Whether the application is premature - The Civil Service Association of Western Australia Incorporated -v- Director General, Housing Authority - PSACR 25 of 2015 - Public Service Arbitrator - Commissioner T Emmanuel - 30/11/2016.....	1630
COMMISSIONER	
Industrial law (WA) - Contractual benefits claim - Alternative claims - Claim for unpaid wages, superannuation and annual leave if employment under a fixed term contract - Claim in alternative for payment of superannuation, annual leave and payment in lieu of notice if no fixed term contract - Held no fixed term contract - Held that Commission has no jurisdiction to deal with superannuation claims - Held no denied contractual benefits - Mr. Kashlyn Brennan -v- Document Management Experts Pty Ltd - B 169 of 2015 - Commissioner D J Matthews - 29/06/2016	675
Industrial Law (WA) - Termination of employment - Alleged harsh, oppressive and unfair dismissal - Poor performance - Lateness - Principles applied - Applicant was not unfairly dismissed - Applicant received fair warning - Application dismissed - Michael James Lynch -v- Diana Quan, Busy Bee Chemist and Newsagency - U 31 of 2016 - Commissioner T Emmanuel - 8/07/2016.....	679
Apprehended bias - Application for recusal - Principles considered - Reasonable apprehension of bias not made out - Application dismissed - Bonifassi Nicolas; Nicolas Bonifassi -v- E.J.Fillaudeau and J.J.Maindok; Emmanuel Fillaudeau and J.J. Maindok - U 33 of 2016 and B 33 of 2016 - Commissioner T Emmanuel - 1/07/2016.....	684
Denied contractual entitlements – Bonus payment – Fair Work Commission – Deed of Release/Agreement – Breach of agreement – Whether the agreement settled all matters associated with the employment –Whether the application can proceed - Mr. Ashwin Panchal -v- Utopia C.A. Pty Ltd. - B 5 of 2016 - Chief Commissioner P E Scott - 27/06/2016.....	688
Industrial Law (WA) - Application for classification as untrained teacher - Work value principles applied - Application dismissed - United Voice WA -v- The Director General Department of Education - CR 51 of 2012 - Acting Senior Commissioner S J Kenner - 23/06/2016	692
Denied contractual entitlement - Alleged unpaid commission - Claim for commission as a contractual entitlement or a matter of merit - Contract of employment - Whether policy incorporated into contract of employment - Discretion for employer to unilaterally amend policy - Implied term - Martin Geoffrey Grasett -v- Scania Australia Pty Ltd - B 189 of 2015 - Chief Commissioner P E Scott - 28/07/2016	1298
Denied contractual entitlements – Contract of employment – Commissions for the sale of land – Cause of the listing – Inconsistent evidence - Brian John Nathan -v- Hevbren Pty Ltd as Trustee of the AnnaNdale Family Trust t/as Lagoon Realty - B 22 of 2016 - Chief Commissioner P E Scott - 19/07/2016	1309
Application for declaration pursuant to section 42H - Dispute as to initiation of bargaining - Steps to initiate bargaining set out in Industrial Relations Act 1979 (WA) - Steps not followed - Held bargaining not initiated - Application dismissed - Western Australian Police Union of Workers -v- Commissioner of Police - APPL 44 of 2016 - Commissioner D J Matthews - 8/08/2016.....	1315
Industrial Law (WA) - Contractual benefits claim - Preliminary issue - Whether terms and conditions of Enterprise Agreement were expressly incorporated into employee's contract of employment - Principles applied - Clear words of agreement between contracting parties required - Application dismissed - Thomas George Hartwig -v- Interstate Enterprises Pty Ltd trading as ATS Recruitment Services - B 181 of 2015 - Senior Commissioner S J Kenner - 5/09/2016	1359
Claim for denied contractual benefits - Claim disputed - Employment ended - Claim for payment of imported annual leave at rate of pay as at termination - Respondent contends only leave accrued during period of employment paid at rate of pay as at termination - Held imported annual leave payable at rate of pay as at termination - Respondent contentions in alternative - Section 26 Industrial Relations Act 1979 (WA) - Unfair to pay imported leave at rate of pay as at termination - Unjust enrichment of claimant - Breach of warranties by claimant - Not in public interest to make orders for payment of imported leave at rate of pay as at termination - Contentions under section 26(1) not industrial matters - No jurisdiction under Industrial Relations Act 1979 (WA) to decide contentions - Claim succeeds - Guy Millman -v- United Petroleum Pty Ltd - B 28 of 2016 - Commissioner D J Matthews - 29/08/2016	1365
Industrial Law (WA) - Interpretation of industrial agreement - Principles of construction considered - Alteration of hours of work - Meaning of 'major changes' - Independent Education Union of Western Australia, Union of Employees (IEUwa) -v- Roman Catholic Archbishop of Perth - APPL 14 of 2016 - Commissioner T Emmanuel - 9/09/2016.....	1400
Claim B 103 of 2016 – Contractual benefits claim – Claim based on Professional Training Agreement between claimant and respondent – No contract of employment – Claim dismissed Claim B 104 of 2016 – Contractual benefits claim – Preliminary matter – Relationship between contract of employment and Professional Training Agreement – Matter to proceed to full hearing - Robert Kinneen -v- Philip George Jonath; Whelans - B 103 of 2016 and B 104 of 2016 - Commissioner D J Matthews - 23/09/2016.....	1412

CUMULATIVE DIGEST—continued

	Page
COMMISSIONER—continued	
Industrial law (WA) - Contractual benefits claim - Claim for notice within trial period - Principles applied - Claim allowed - Bhupinder Narwal -v- Madlink Australia Pty. Ltd - B 53 of 2016 - Commissioner D J Matthews - 28/09/2016.....	1415
Industrial law (WA) - Termination of employment - Unfair dismissal - Teacher - Substandard performance - Performance issues - Performance assessment process - Australian Professional Standards for Teachers - Improvement Action Plan - Denial of transfer during IAP - Role of mentor and mentee - Jean Stewart -v- Director General, Department of Education - U 211 of 2015 - Chief Commissioner P E Scott - 13/10/2016.....	1419
Industrial law (WA) - Termination of employment - Alleged harsh, oppressive and unfair dismissal - Held termination due to downturn in respondent's business - Held process of dismissal unfair and harsh - Compensation awarded - John Michael Tosa -v- Busseton Pest and Weed Control - U 111 of 2016 - Commissioner D J Matthews - 27/09/2016.....	1435
Industrial Law (WA) - Whether or not Regulations have been fairly and properly applied - Principles applied - Relevant provisions of the Regulations have been fairly and properly applied - Application dismissed - Bradley Owen Collard -v- CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER Department for Child Protection and Family Support - APPL 144 of 2015 - Senior Commissioner S J Kenner - 30/08/2016...	1450
Industrial Law (WA) - Occupational Safety and Health - Whether termination on grounds of redundancy was genuine - Whether employee was dismissed as a result of raising occupational safety and health issues - Preliminary issue - Whether Tribunal has jurisdiction - Whether employee was an elected safety and health representative - Principles applied - Responsibilities exercised were not those of a safety and health representative for the purposes of the Occupational Safety and Health Act 1984 - Application dismissed - Steve Kape -v- The Golden Mile Loopline Railway Society Inc. - OSHT 4 of 2016 - Senior Commissioner S J Kenner - 5/09/2016.....	1456
Industrial Law (WA) - Termination of employment - Harsh, oppressive and unfair dismissal - Principles applied - Summary dismissal for alleged misconduct - Lack of warnings - Applicant harshly and unfairly dismissed - Compensation awarded - Contractual benefits claim - Claim for payment in lieu of notice and annual leave accrual - Applicant entitled to benefits claimed - Applications upheld - Declaration and order made - Nicolas Bonifassi -v- E.J Fillaudeau and J.J Maindok TRADING AS FILLAUDEAUS - U 33 of 2016 and B 33 of 2016 - Commissioner T Emmanuel - 12/10/2016.....	1507
Industrial law (WA) - Termination of employment - Alleged harsh, oppressive and unfair dismissal - Termination due to poor performance of applicant - Applicant made aware and afforded time to improve performance - Applicant failed to improve performance - Some harshness attached to manner of dismissal - Compensation awarded - Helen Hua -v- RM & JM Wilson T/AS Images Embroidery - U 91 of 2016 - Commissioner D J Matthews - 10/10/2016.....	1522
Industrial law (WA) - Contractual benefits claim - Claim for payment of amount equal to 100% of annual salary - Principles applied - Held contract terminated inside probationary period - Clause relied upon did not apply - Clause not breached - Claim dismissed - Peter Kay -v- City of Perth - B 123 of 2016 - Commissioner D J Matthews - 17/10/2016.....	1526
Industrial Law (WA) - Termination of employment - Harsh, oppressive and unfair dismissal - Principles applied - Redundancy - Whether the applicant was consulted - No consultation - Applicant harshly and unfairly dismissed - Compensation awarded - Application upheld - Declaration and order made - Alison Palmer -v- Forrest Personnel Inc - U 153 of 2015 - Commissioner T Emmanuel - 4/11/2016.....	1529
Industrial Law (WA) - Contractual benefits claim - Whether contractual entitlement to payment of costs associated with obtaining permanent residency - Whether contractual entitlement to a bonus or commission payment - Whether payments were discretionary - Principles applied - Application dismissed - Nathan Bradley -v- Binder Group Pty Ltd - B 93 of 2015 - Senior Commissioner S J Kenner - 30/08/2016.....	1604
Unpaid wages - order made - Cameron Drew -v- Benjamin Drew - B 160 of 2016 - Commissioner D J Matthews - 13/12/2016.....	1614
Unfair dismissal claim - Applicant dismissed because new attitude taken to stale report about him - Decision not reasonable - No good evidence of breakdown in working relationship - Compensation and reinstatement ordered - Alan Clarence Jacobs -v- COMMISSIONER OF POLICE - U 145 of 2016 - Commissioner D J Matthews - 18/11/2016.....	1616
Industrial law (WA) - Contractual benefits claim - Claimant alleged respondent had to train him to become a licensed surveyor - Principles applied - No contractual term express or implied for employer to ensure necessary training - Claim dismissed - Robert Kinneen -v- Whelans - B 104 of 2016 - Commissioner D J Matthews - 14/11/2016.....	1620
Unfair dismissal application - Respondent a trading corporation - Western Australian Industrial Relations Commission does not have jurisdiction - Application dismissed - Kym Sheldon -v- HR Department: Centrecare ABN 98 651 609 161 - U 146 of 2016 - Commissioner D J Matthews - 18/11/2016.....	1625
Industrial law (WA) - Termination of employment - Harsh, oppressive and unfair dismissal - Conference pursuant to s 44 of the Industrial Relations Act 1979 (WA) - Application for interim order that salary payments continue pending resolution of the claim - Discretionary power - Whether there is a particular circumstance in existence which would give rise to the exercise by the Commission of the power to grant interim relief - Financial difficulty not a sufficient reason to warrant the grant of interim relief - Application refused - The State School Teachers' Union of W.A. (Incorporated) -v- The Director General, Department of Education - C 31 of 2015 - Commissioner S J Kenner - 24/09/2015.....	1627
Industrial Law (WA) - Referral to Commission under Public Sector Management Act 1994 - Voluntary redundancy - Dispute over attraction and retention incentive payment - Whether Regulations fairly and properly applied - Whether Commission has jurisdiction - Principles applied - For a referral to the Commission under s 95(2)(b) to be valid, the person aggrieved by the decision must be in an extant employment relationship with their employer as at the time of the referral - Contractual benefits claim - All industrial matters in connection with a "government officer" fall exclusively within the jurisdiction of the Arbitrator - Application dismissed for want of jurisdiction - Matthew Crowley -v- Department of Commerce - APPL 33 of 2016 - Senior Commissioner S J Kenner - 16/11/2016.....	1648
POLICE APPEAL	
Application to tender new evidence - Removal of police officer - Loss of confidence by Commissioner of Police - Relevance of proposed new evidence on remedy - Shane Michael Ferguson -v- The Commissioner of Police - APPL 109 of 2015 - Police Appeal - Chief Commissioner P E Scott Commissioner T Emmanuel Commissioner D J Matthews - 7/12/2016.....	1599